

June 14, 2023 Meeting Transcript

Miami City Commission June 14, 2023

Transcript of video recording available at:
https://miamifl.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=1&clip_id=1200

**PLAINTIFFS' TRIAL
EXHIBIT**

P28

1:22-cv-24066-KMM

exhibitsticker.com

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

[Audio starts 00:00:21]

Christine King: – redrawing our maps for redistricting as we are required to do by federal law.

Today is June 14th, 2023, and we shall begin shortly. We just have to get two more of my colleagues here. I didn't want to start until we had everyone because this is important to the entire city of Miami. So –

Manolo Reyes: But, we are three so we should – we have four.

Christine King: No, we have five.

Manolo Reyes: Okay.

Christine King: We have five. We –

Manolo Reyes: We have got five?

Christine King: Yes we have five but I didn't – although we had a quorum, I didn't want to start until we had everyone here because this is important to the entire city of Miami. So hold on one second.

[Silence]

As is tradition, we will open this meeting with prayer. I am honored to have Father Denrick Rolle from St. Agnes located in Overtown.

Denrick Rolle: Please stand. Let us pray. Almighty God we first give you thanks for life, for the opportunity to gather in this place. We ask that your Holy Spirit would rest upon each person represented here. We ask your blessing upon each commissioner. We ask your blessing upon those who work in our city. We ask that you fill us with love in our deliberations, with respect for one another.

Enable us with the power to see beyond the present time, to understand the needs and desires of all people, and to seek fairness, the expulsion of greed and hatred in our society. We ask your

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 blessing upon the chairperson, we ask that your power resonates throughout this place, for the
2 honor and glory of your name, and for the building up of all people, through Christ our Lord.
3 Amen.

4 Audience: Amen.

5 Christine King: And at this time, Commissioner Alex Díaz de la Portilla would you honor us
6 with the pledge of allegiance?

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I pledge allegiance –

8 All: – to the flag of the United States of America, and to the republic for which it stands, one
9 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

10 Christine King: Where's the city attorney? At this time, I will have the city attorney read a
11 statement into the record. Oh I didn't even realize you were here.

12 Victoria Méndez: Detailed information about the processes, order of business, rules of
13 procedure and scheduling or rescheduling of city commission meetings can be found in Chapter
14 2, Article 2 of the city code. A copy of which is available online at www.municode.com. Any
15 person who is a lobbyist pursuant to Chapter 2, Article 6 of the city code must register with the
16 city clerk and comply with related city requirements for lobbyists before appearing before the city
17 commission.

18 A person may not lobby a city official, board member, or staff member until registering. A
19 copy of code section about lobbyists is available in the city clerk's office or online at
20 www.municode.com. Any person making a presentation, formal request or petition to a city
21 commission concerning real property must make the disclosures required by the code in writing.
22 A copy of this code section is available at the office of the city clerk or online at
23 www.municode.com.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 The city of Miami requires that anyone requesting action by the city commission must disclose
2 before the hearing, any consideration provided or committed to anyone for agreement to support
3 or withhold objection to the requested action pursuant to city code section 2-8. In accordance to 2-
4 33(f) and (g) of the city code, the agenda material for each item on the agenda is available during
5 business hours. And the clerk's office online, 24 hours a day at www.miamigov.com.

6 Any person may be heard by a city commission through the chair for not more than two minutes
7 on the proposition before the city commission unless modified by the chair. Public comment will
8 begin at approximately 10:45 and remain open until the public comment is closed by the chair.
9 Members of the public wishing to address the body may do so by submitting written comments
10 via the online comment form.

11 Please visit www.miamigov.com/meetinginstructions for detailed instructions on how to
12 provide public comment using the online public comment form. The comments submitted through
13 the comment form have been and will be distributed to elected officials, their staff in the city
14 administration throughout the day so that elected officials may consider comments prior to taking
15 any action.

16 Additionally, the online comment form will remain open during the meeting to accept
17 comments and distribute to elected officials, their staff and city administration up until the chair
18 closes public comment. Public comment may also be provided live at city hall, located at 3500 Pan
19 American Drive, Miami, Florida, subject to any and all rules as they may be amended.

20 If the proposition is being continued or rescheduled, the opportunity to be heard may be at such
21 later date before the city commission takes action on such proposition. When addressing the city
22 commission, the member of the public must first state their name, their address and what item will
23 be spoken about. Any person with a disability requiring assistance, auxiliary aids and services for

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 this meeting may notify the city clerk.

2 The city has provided different public comment methods to indicate, among other things, a
3 public support, opposition and neutrality on items and topics to be discussed at the city commission
4 meeting in compliance with section 286.0114(4)(c), Florida Statutes. The public has been given
5 the opportunity to provide public comment during the meeting and within reasonable proximity
6 and time before the meeting.

7 Anyone wishing a verbatim record of the item considered at this meeting may request it at the
8 Office of Communications or view it online at www.miamigov.com. Please silence all cellphones
9 and other noise making devices at this time. This meeting will be viewed live on Miami TV, the
10 city's Facebook page, the city's Twitter page, the city's YouTube channel and Comcast channel
11 77. The broadcast will also have closed captioning. Thank you.

12 Christine King: Thank you Victoria. Mr. City Clerk, do you need to read a statement for the
13 record?

14 Todd Hannon: No ma'am.

15 Christine King: Okay. At this time I will begin the public comment. But before I begin the
16 public comment I'd like to recognize seniors from my district who have come to participate in this
17 process. Welcome, you guys, good to see you. So at this time I'm going to open the floor for public
18 comment. Anyone wishing to make a comment on this matter, redistricting, please step forward.

19 Miguel Gabela: May I speak?

20 Victoria Méndez: [inaudible 00:09:01]

21 Christine King: Better idea. The plaintiffs have a presentation and perhaps it would be better if
22 the plaintiffs made their presentation so that public comments can be borne after the plaintiffs make
23 their presentation. So I'm going to allow the plaintiffs to make their presentation and then we'll

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 have public comments. Plaintiffs?

2 Yanelis Valdes: Hello, good morning. My name is Yanelis Valdes; I am the director of
3 organizing and advocacy at Engage Miami. I'm also a resident in the city of Miami, I'm from the
4 Omni area and I'm an individual plaintiff on the lawsuit. I wanted to start off by saying thank you
5 for convening this special meeting to advance the process to remedy the racial gerrymander that
6 unconstitutionally divides voters along racial lines and slices through our neighborhoods, violating
7 our rights.

8 We sent a letter last month that we continue to stand by, with two proposed maps that present
9 a new vision for Miami. One that moves us forward rather than holds us back. One that advances
10 representation for all residents rather than constrains it. One that brings us together rather than
11 divides us. Yesterday we shared a new map incorporating community feedback and input from
12 you all. I have printed copies that I can share with you all.

13 All the maps that we've submitted feature compact and logical districts that respect
14 neighborhoods, follow major geographic boundaries, and preserve genuine communities of
15 interest. They don't pack Hispanic voters into three specific districts and no longer designate one
16 district as an Anglo access seat. They also fully comply with the VRA and provides Black voters
17 with the ability to elect their preferred candidate in District 5.

18 The new map, Map 3, unites Overtown once again in District 5, which was divided in the map
19 passed last year. It also keeps other key neighborhoods unified like Flagami, Edgewater, Allapattah
20 and Shenandoah. The court has given you all an opportunity and the responsibility to undo the
21 violations and remedy the wrongs in the map passed last year. I hope that the community is
22 centered throughout the discussion today, and the maps that we've worked hard to put together are
23 discussed at length and are very seriously considered. Miami residents deserve to have their vote

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 and voice reflected in the makeup of our city districts. Thank you.

2 Christine King: Thank you.

3 Victoria Méndez: I'm sorry madam chair I just wanted – oh, are you passing out the maps?
4 Thank you.

5 Christine King: And at this time, I will have the representatives for the city of Miami present
6 the map that they have prepared.

7 Yanelis Valdes: I just want to add, we're out of the printed maps, but we'll be available to
8 answer your questions if you all have any. Thank you.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Can I ask a question? A quick one. For Engage Miami, who are you?
10 Who do you represent? You have to say – you have to say it here.

11 Yanelis Valdes: Yeah, so we are one of the plaintiffs in the case, we do civic engagement, civic
12 education in the community. So redistricting was a really important process for us to be involved
13 in.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: How long have you been in existence?

15 Yanelis Valdes: I'm sorry?

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: How long have you been in existence?

17 Yanelis Valdes: Since 2015.

18 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Since 2015. And who are your members?

19 Yanelis Valdes: Our members are a variety of young folks from across the county. We have –
20 I don't know off the top of my head but a good amount in the city of Miami as well.

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: You don't remember how many members you have?

22 Yanelis Valdes: Not in the city of Miami, but we have about 150 members, I would say,
23 somewhere between three – 30 and 50 are in the city of Miami.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay, thank you.

Yanelis Valdes: Thank you.

Miguel De Grandy: Madam Chair we just need a couple minutes to setup. But while that's happening, the map that you have in front of you was delivered to me at 8 o'clock yesterday. Can you hear me? So we haven't had a chance to do a full review of that map. However, I could tell you, you know, some of the things is very similar in performance to their Alternative 2, which is what we had prepared to discuss today and compare to our proposal. So at the end I'll give you some thoughts on the map that's in front of you that was delivered yesterday. But again, it, it works the same political calculus as the maps in Alternative 2.

And with that let's go to slide two. And again, good morning commissioners. Now, on the screen right now is our proposed plan. But before I walk you through it let me take a few minutes to discuss where we are in comparison to the plaintiffs' proposals. We've now had an opportunity to review their Alternative 1 and their Alternative 2 fully. And the one thing that this commission and the plaintiffs agree with is that District 5 is required by the Voting Rights Act. But we believe the configuration of plaintiffs' D5, which includes severing parts of Overtown, may negatively impact the ability of this compact and cohesive community to have an equal opportunity to elect the candidate of choice throughout the decade that this plan will be in place.

Indeed plaintiffs seem to ignore the fact that in the last 30 years, the demographic trends evidence significant gentrification in D5, and the fact that the Black population in the city has continued to decline, both in absolute and relative terms. Now, I know this commission has reviewed and is very aware of these gentrifying development issues because they necessarily come before this body. So I will not spend time in our presentation going what – through what you already know.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Now, we approached the draft of a new plan by using plaintiffs' proposed Alternative 2 as a
2 template, and making changes consistent with the policy choices of the majority of this elected
3 body. And at the outset it is important to acknowledge the obvious. Approximately 70% of
4 Miami's population is Hispanic. And once you draw District 5 in compliance with the VRA, the
5 fact remains that the remaining population of the city is now approximately 75% Hispanic. It is
6 also a fact that the majority of the Hispanic residents live in the central and western parts of the
7 city. Now, because of this reality, both of plaintiffs' alternative plans necessarily include three
8 majority Hispanic districts in that area. Next slide.

9 The plaintiffs' alternatives, which are on the board, intentionally pack the more conservative
10 Hispanic voters in the western areas of the city. Next slide. Plaintiffs' preferred alternative makes
11 D4's voting age population slightly over 95% Hispanic. Plaintiffs' Alternative 2 results in making
12 D4's voting age population almost 96% Hispanic. Now, this slide illustrates how both plans pack
13 the more conservative voters in the western part of the city into D4. By packing more conservative
14 voters into D4, shifting areas around, and submerging part of the compact and cohesive Overtown
15 community in D1, the plan is geared to result in a more liberal voting pattern for D1.

16 In their correspondence, plaintiffs claim that the reason they drew D4 the way that they did it
17 is because they wanted to unite all of Flagami and West Flagler. This, despite the fact that in the
18 six publicly noticed hearings we had before this commission, and the five publicly noticed hearings
19 we had in your respective districts, not one resident, that I am aware of, came to complain that
20 Flagami or West Flagler was divided into two districts. On a side note it's important to point to
21 the fact that plaintiffs' alternatives also split some traditional neighborhoods such as Little Havana.
22 And that is because, as in our draft plan, the goal of keeping traditional communities intact in one
23 district is necessarily subordinate to the need to comply with the constitutional requirement of

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 substantially equalizing district populations. And in that regard, which traditional community may
2 have to be divided is quintessentially a legislative choice. Both of plaintiffs' alternatives also
3 remove parts of Overtown from D5. Again, in the six public meetings and five district meetings
4 that we had, not one resident or organization, including plaintiff NAACP, suggested that you
5 should move Overtown out of D5, so we are at a loss to understand this radical shift in position.
6 Next slide.

7 So, again, moving Overtown into D1 in both alternatives and removing from D1 the most
8 conservative voters from the northwest part of Flagami and West Flagler results in a more liberal-
9 leaning electorate in that district. Next slide. For example, in plaintiffs' Alternative 1, the
10 percentage of Republican registered voters in D1 drops by close to 9% compared to our proposal.
11 In our proposal, President Biden would have received 50% of the vote in the 2020 presidential
12 election in D1, while in the plaintiffs' alternative, he garners 68 – 63.8% of the vote. In the 2018
13 race for governor, DeSantis, the conservative candidate, was over 15 percentage points lower in
14 the plaintiffs' Alternative 1 than in our proposal. And in the 2018 attorney general race, the
15 conservative candidate, Moody, drops just under 15% compared to our proposal. Next slide.

16 In their Alternative 2, the percentage of Republican registered voters in D1 drops by 6% in the
17 plaintiffs' plan compared to our proposal. In our proposal, President Biden would have received
18 50% of the vote in the 2020 presidential election in D1. While in the plaintiffs' proposal, he enjoys
19 57.5% of the vote. In the 2018 race, for governor, DeSantis, the conservative candidate, was nine
20 percentage points lower in the plaintiffs' D1 plan than in our proposal. And in the 2018 attorney
21 general race, the conservative candidate also drops 9% compared to our proposal. So the political
22 objectives of the plaintiffs' plans are clear, measurable, and significant. And plaintiffs' plan may
23 also negatively impact the ability of Black voters to elect a candidate of choice throughout the

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 decade in D5 while submerging parts of the compact and cohesive Black community of Overtown
2 in a district in which they will not have such equal opportunity. Next slide.

3 In contrast, you will see in this slide, our proposed plan keeps historic Overtown intact in
4 District 5. Now as I stated at the beginning, in developing the draft plan that I'm going to present
5 for your consideration, we actually began our work off the plaintiffs' plan, specifically Alternative
6 2. Next slide.

7 In fact as you can see, the general configuration of the districts in plaintiffs' Alternative 2, are
8 in many respects, very similar to our plan. And while it is true that the plaintiffs' plan is certainly
9 visually more compact than our proposal, compactness is not a constitutional requirement. Indeed,
10 federal case law clearly holds that a district may take any shape, even a bizarre shape, as a result
11 of policy or political objectives as long as they are not racially driven. As you will see, the
12 plaintiffs' alternative plan shows three districts in the central part of the city, going east to west, a
13 district going north to south, District 5, and a narrow coastal district, District 2. Frankly, we agree
14 that this is generally the only configuration that makes sense, but there are notable differences in
15 how they draw the lines to distribute the population among the districts in order to achieve a
16 political objective.

17 In the plaintiffs' proposed alternative, District 1 remains in the north central part of the city,
18 although its connection to the west is completely cut off, and those are the conservative voters.
19 District 2 remains a coastal district, although it shifts more to the south. District 3 does change
20 significantly, resulting in splitting Little Havana. District 4 migrates west and packs more
21 conservative voters all into one district. And District 5 generally runs north to south but remove
22 parts of Overtown and D5's connection to the river, the Wharf and the MRC.

23 Now, our plan takes into account the political and policy considerations, such as where

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 commissioners have invested district resources in their projects, or the need to balance poor areas
2 with areas that have significant economic potential or activity as requested by Commissioner King
3 and the majority of this commission. Thus we've made modifications to the plaintiffs' alternatives
4 that would result in a different political calculus than the considerations which clearly drive the
5 plaintiffs' plans.

6 As you can see in the slide, uh, – let me make sure that I've got the right slide. Yes. As you
7 can see in the slide before you, the considera – configuration of plaintiffs' D5 is similar and in
8 most of the northern end, identical to the D5 proposed in our plan. Now, recognizing that D5 is
9 subject to the VRA, the legal directive in crafting this district was to ensure compliance with the
10 Voting Rights Act. But we did so with an emphasis on using natural and manmade boundaries,
11 and keeping as many communities of interest together as feasible. Next slide.

12 We were also cognizant of Commissioner King's desire to include areas that would generate
13 significant economic activity, and would enhance what she has publicly described as the lowest
14 per capita income district in the city. So logically we started at the northern end of the city's
15 municipal boundaries and worked our way down. As you can see in the northern end, D5 includes
16 all of the traditional neighborhoods of Shorecrest, Belle Meade, Bayside, Little River, Lemon City,
17 Liberty City, and Buena Vista. Going further south, areas such as Wynwood, Midtown, and the
18 Design District which have significant economic and employment activity were included.
19 Commissioner King is working diligently on issues such as affordable housing, public transit
20 solutions, et cetera, and she has strongly advocated to have Overtown remain in her district because
21 the residents of that area share the same concerns and needs with regard to those issues as the more
22 central and northern parts of her district. And our proposed plan accommodates that request.

23 Finally, we included a small part of the riverfront in downtown based on the chairwoman's

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 request to include The Wharf and the MRC in her district. We also had to make minor jagged edges
2 to keep the overall deviation low. Nevertheless, District 5 boundaries consistently – consist mainly
3 of natural and manmade boundaries such as the city’s municipal boundaries, the bay, the railroad,
4 the Miami River, an expressway, and the contours of traditional neighborhoods.

5 Now, in regard to District 1, next slide, we restored the connection to part of the western part
6 of the city, thereby distributing the more conservative voters in the west within two districts. Both
7 our plan and the plaintiffs’ acknowledge – alternative acknowledge that there should be a district
8 containing the bulk of the Miami riverfront. This is an important business community organized
9 through the Miami River Commission that is politically active in matters such as land use and
10 other issues affecting the river and its shores. However, we approach it in a different consider –
11 configuration only because of the decision to keep Overtown in D5, and Commissioner King’s
12 request to keep the economic potential of The Wharf, the redeveloping MRC, as well as portions
13 of downtown in her district. As you can see when you look at the southeast portion of D1, that
14 finger coming down looks irregular only because the eastern part follows the contours of
15 Overtown. Now, apart from the river constituency, the district includes traditional neighborhoods
16 of Allapattah, Civic Center, Grapeland Heights, and parts of West Flagler and Flagami. The
17 majority of District 1’s boundaries also track significant manmade and natural boundaries such as
18 water boundaries, major roads, the city’s municipal boundaries, the borders – and the borders of
19 traditional neighborhoods as well as I-95. Next slide.

20 Now, plaintiffs’ alternatives demonstrates that it makes logical and planning sense to configure
21 D2 as a coastal district, and in fact they did so, just like we did so. In both the plaintiffs’ alternatives
22 and our proposed plan, D2 remains a coastal district. Indeed the residential uses in the central and
23 northeastern coastal areas consist to a significant degree of high-rise condominiums and

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 apartments in the city's waterfront and are markedly different than the suburban residential uses
2 and infrastructure challenges to the west. Both plans do move the sliver of the North Grove south
3 of US 1 that had been placed in D4, back into D2. Next slide.

4 However, our proposed plan smooths out and extends the area north that was in D2 and was
5 assigned to D3 in a similar manner as in the plan Commissioner Reyes had proposed back when,
6 in order to equalize population which was ultimately not adopted by this commission. And this
7 approach was actually referred to by the court as an al – by the court as an alternative map with
8 less of a discriminatory impact. Next slide. Our proposed D2 goes further north than the plaintiffs'
9 alternative to take parts of Morningside, while plaintiffs' alternative ends around Edgewater. D2
10 includes significant portions of traditional neighborhoods such as Morningside, Bay Point, Omni,
11 Downtown, Brickell and Coconut Grove.

12 Now, the plaintiffs' configurations of D3 and D4 are markedly different in our proposed plan
13 than in the plaintiffs' alternative. However, it's important to first note the obvious; put the first and
14 the next slide off – up. As I said, it's important to note the obvious which is – put the other slide
15 up, and the next slide up if you may. These two slides show – of the plaintiffs' own alternatives,
16 help to illustrate that there is no way to apportion the population of those two districts in a manner
17 that would not result in majority Hispanic percentages in both, simply because the great majority
18 of Hispanics live in that area. That is just a fact based on the demographics of the folks that live in
19 those areas. Accepting this fact, it is clear that the different approaches in crafting the two districts
20 between our proposal and the plaintiffs' alternative are nothing but a difference in policy and
21 political considerations. Now I – as I explained before, the plaintiffs' plan was designed to
22 concentrate the most conservative voters into D4. And you see it right there. Thus the plaintiffs'
23 plan makes policy choices as to which communities belong in the respective districts. But those

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 policy choices are uniquely a legislative prerogative.

2 For example, plaintiffs' configuration removes all of Shenandoah and parts of Silver Bluff from
3 D4, and joins those communities with parts of a fractured Little Havana. Next slide. Our proposed
4 plan unpacks their District 4 in the west, which does result in a split of Flagami, but District 4's
5 configuration in our draft preserves the bulk of Shenandoah in D4, Silver Bluff, and Coral Gate in
6 one district. Now, it's important to note that the decision to design D4 in that manner was based,
7 in part, on the request of Commissioner Reyes to maintain in his district areas such as Shenandoah,
8 which through his leadership the city has invested and will be investing significant resources and
9 capital to improve parks and infrastructure. Now, we also extended the southern border of D4 to
10 US 1 in order to use that highway as a logical boundary. D4's other boundaries include the city's
11 municipal boundaries, the border between most of Shenandoah and other traditional communities.
12 Now, next slide please.

13 Finally, District 3 now wraps around District 4. Again, that configuration was necessary to
14 preserve most of Shenandoah in D4, while preserving Little Havana intact in D3, as well as the
15 need to equalize population. In our draft, the traditional neighborhoods of Little Havana and the
16 Roads, as well as a significant parts of riverside, are kept within D3. D3 utilizes manmade and
17 natural borders such as the Miami River, Bayshore Drive, as logical boundaries. Next slide.

18 Finally, plaintiffs' proposed alternative has a point – a 6.9% deviation, while our plan better
19 complies with the goal of substantial equality among districts with 2.6% deviation, making it more
20 consistent with constitutional requirements.

21 Now, let me make a couple of comments if I can pull them up on the map that we received
22 yesterday. On visual observation you could see the same political objective of packing
23 conservative voters in District 4 because it is the same District 4 as in the alternative that we were

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 able to fully review. The configuration of District 1 looks very similar to the configuration we
2 reviewed and I would expect the same political performance. Indeed, the initial data that we were
3 able to extract last night indicates almost identical political performance than the Alternative 2 that
4 we evaluated. I could also tell you, as I understand the community of Overtown, that it fractures
5 the cohesive Overtown community. I think plaintiffs have their own impression of where
6 Overtown is. But if you Google for Miami neighborhood maps, the ones I've seen, including your
7 NET map, shows a configuration consistent with our understanding. But I'll leave that to the
8 district commissioner who is in the best position to tell us what constitutes Overtown. Their plan
9 also continues, their Alternative 3, to split Little Havana.

10 So in summary commissioners, we believe our plan better reflects the political and policy
11 choices of this commission. It incorporates much of the input provided in previous public hearings,
12 and complies with both the Constitution and the Voting Rights Act. And with that, I thank you for
13 the time and opportunity to make this presentation.

14 Sabina Covo: Madam Chair can we make – do questions now or later on?

15 Christine King: After public comments.

16 Sabina Covo: Okay, because I have some. Thank you.

17 Christine King: At this time, I'll open the floor for public comment. You have seen what the
18 plaintiffs are proposing and you are seeing what the city's attorneys are proposing, and now you
19 may make your comments.

20 Victoria Méndez: Madam Chair, and the plaintiffs said that they're available, their plaintiffs'
21 attorneys are available if the commission has any questions.

22 Christine King: Good morning.

23 Rev. Nathaniel Robinson III: Good morning commissioner, chairwoman King. My name is

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Reverend Nathaniel Robinson III, senior pastor of Greater St. Paul AME Church and one of the
2 plaintiffs in the case. I want to say very quickly today is that, the city commission is the only gov
3 – body with the authority to adopt a map. It’s the only – we – the plaintiffs in the case don’t have
4 the authority to do that. As a result of the ruling that the judge gave, the plaintiffs in the case were
5 given three days to offer a recommendation for the city commission. What’s being presented here
6 today is somewhat a false narrative, in my opinion, that plaintiffs have a plan. We – there’s no plan
7 from the plaintiffs, it’s an opportunity to present a recommendation for the commission to consider,
8 as they are the only governing body with the authority to vote on a map.

9 What we did do that we believe was not done by the consultants who had months and months
10 to do this is, since we made those recommendations, we had conversations with communities. And
11 after a mediation that ended at 6:00 p.m. yesterday, in two hours we responded to the conversations
12 we’ve had with community members and counsel for the city, and made adjustments. That’s why
13 the map was only given at 8 o’clock last night. But it took into consideration what the BNA asked
14 for, it took into consideration the new map that we presented for reco – as a recommendation. Puts
15 Overtown back, the entirety of traditional Overtown, back into District 5. It also includes economic
16 drivers like the southwest CRA and parts and portions of the Omni CRA.

17 So these are things that we’re doing on the fly within hours, within days, that our city
18 consultants were not able to do but only as recommendations because we don’t have the authority
19 to present any plan or implement anything. But as plaintiffs and as residents of the city and
20 organizations from our city, we’re doing our best to help and assist the city by offering
21 recommendations. And for our recommendations to be attacked, seems to be somewhat of a false
22 narrative today. In addition, we talked – we looked at 0.5% of a change and 0.5% is not a big
23 change but thank you for your time.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: Thank you. Good morning.

2 James Fried: Hi. Hi. James Fried, 2575 South Bayshore Drive, Miami. I support
3 neighborhoods. I believe that the ACLU states, voting districts should respect neighborhoods.
4 Drawing borders to show prejudice to race is illegal. Why is the consultant talking about race and
5 politics, it sounds like gerrymandering. I have seen how eager the residents of the West Grove
6 have been to remain part of their traditional Coconut Grove. I believe that the North Grove should
7 remain intact. I want to thank everybody for their time and consideration, please keep our
8 neighborhoods together and please keep the North Grove part of District 2. Thank you so much
9 madam commissioner.

10 Christine King: Good morning.

11 Sam Latimore: Good morning. Good morning. My name is Professor Sam Latimore, 937 NW
12 55th Street. Been a resident of the city of Miami, Liberty City, for a number of years, going back
13 to the '59. We're here to advocate for some things that I think we have just become involved in.
14 And we feel very strongly that Overtown needs to remain in District 5. And our assumption is not
15 based upon what I hear all the time and what is fractioning our community, is that we have a
16 conservative base versus a progressive base, a conservative base versus a liberal base. And that
17 seems to be the tenor of much of the discussion not only in Miami but around the state. Our point
18 is that that has always been a historically Black community. Uh, we grew up in there, it was the
19 foundation of a lot of things that happened in the city of Miami. And so we would be arguing and,
20 um, suggesting that it be remain as it was and we keep politics out of it. It's becoming frustrating
21 to hear the conservative. What is a conservative? Is a conservative one person that adopts a political
22 position versus another assertion? And that's what I've heard all this morning. That we want to put
23 conservatives here and liberals here. My point is, that we will be arguing that Overtown remains

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 that. It's always been historically Black, it is a foundation of what city of Miami rose out of. And
2 we also would like to see that The Wharf and MRC remain in District 5 as well. We have, because
3 of the conservatives and this, we have a community which has been disenfranchised. Which will
4 not – which do not have the economic basis that other groups have. And we would suggest and we
5 would like to offer that MRC and The Wharf remain in District 5 because it begins to give back to
6 those communities some of the things that conservatively have been taken away. This is a
7 tremendously underserved community, and it's not underserved because it chose to do that, but
8 because of the fractionalization of this community. There is a financial report – support that this
9 particular place has for us and it's critical that for those of us that have been here long before the
10 change in our communities, that we put – we leave those two positions and areas intact. Thank you
11 very much commissioners.

12 Christine King: Thank you.

13 Sam Latimore: Thank you.

14 Christine King: Good morning.

15 Marcos Loureiro: Good morning. Thanks for the opportunity. My name is Marcos Loureiro,
16 I'm the vice president of Biscayne Neighborhoods Association. We have – Biscayne
17 Neighborhoods Association, BNA. Goes from Tuttle, from the Arsht Center to the 38th Street, all
18 the way to the track of the train. This is an association that is in place for over 10, almost 15 years
19 and we have made a lot of progress. And I have reached the plaintiffs, I spoke with Commissioner
20 Covo, Commissioner Reyes, and I had the opportunity today to discuss with the consultant. Our
21 ask, don't divide us. Don't put Edgewater, one piece in one district, another piece in another
22 district. We want to continue having the success that we are having. Thank you.

23 Christine King: Thank you. Good morning.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Vivian Perkins: Good morning. My name's Vivian Perkins, my address is 1150 NW 49th
2 Street. I'm here to speak on PS1 14148. Districting, to the commissioners please, listen very
3 carefully. Everything that lives together grows together. To split up a community that has been
4 traditionally put there and, and the CRA growing it, and because it's a low-income area, let's keep
5 it growing, let's keep it loving, let's keep it by law. And the law shows love. In order to give that
6 love, we are determined to face equal challenges, and those challenges would be to keep it the
7 same. Why change? Why change it in the way that it's not going to help anyone? How can you
8 help anyone if you change and change and go on with things that you're determined to do it by
9 data, by people. But it does take people and their votes. So let's remember that we are about people.
10 The people I represent and the community I represent, we are all for Commissioner Christine
11 King's plan, mainly because it's the right one. Thank you.

12 Christine King: Thank you.

13 Vivian Perkins: Oh, it's Flag Day.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And Trump's birthday.

15 Andy Parrish: Good morning commissioners.

16 Christine King: Good morning.

17 Andy Parrish: 3940 Main Highway. Um, grateful to be here, I've been in a lot of these. I'm
18 learning a lot about redistricting. I thought I knew a little bit but I didn't and every one of these
19 meetings I come to I learn more. I started out saying, I know there's a 10% requirement, all the
20 districts have to be within 10% of each other, and I thought it was, mainly about making sure that
21 the Black vote is not disenfranchised, and that's about all I knew. And now as I've come to more
22 of these meeting I see what the Voting Rights Act, to me, is about is communities of interest.
23 Communities of interest, while they do take into account ethnicity and race, it's much more than

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 that. It's really, from my take of what I've learned so far, and I'm learning every day, it's about
2 neighborhoods. So to me, communities of interest, which the Voting Rights Act talks about, is
3 using the building blocks of neighborhoods, and also geographic boundaries and natural
4 boundaries and US 1 and all that, but also to put voters together in a community based on
5 neighborhoods. So any, any plan that supports neighborhoods to the maximum amount, I think, is
6 what should be done, and then I think we'll start getting voter participation again in the city, which
7 as we all know, is, abysmally low. The turnout for local elections is probably less than 15%. If we
8 reunite neighborhoods, I think we're going to see the voting percentage go up hugely, and we're
9 going to see people say, yes, this is my neighborhood and it includes Black, white, Hispanic. We
10 all know that the community is mostly Hispanic, but I think communities of interests bridges over
11 that, it's based on neighborhoods. Thank you so much for letting me speak.

12 Christine King: Thank you.

13 Barbara Lange: My name is Barbara Lange, 3901 Braganza Avenue, Coconut Grove. I'm
14 going to be quick. Um, this is a –

15 Miguel Díaz de la Portilla: Get closer.

16 Barbara Lange: This is a bad map, you need to reunite Coconut Grove.

17 Miguel Gabela: Hello, good afternoon. My name is Miguel Angel Gabela, 1701 NW South
18 River Drive, Miami, Florida, 33125. I am a candidate and I'd like to ask, it's not clear to me, I
19 can't see the map here. My house is right on the very border on 17th Avenue. Could somebody
20 tell me please if my house is inside the district or not. Because here's –

21 Christine King: I'm sorry sir.

22 Miguel Gabela: – the problem that we're going to have.

23 Christine King: I'm sorry sir.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel Gabela: Well, okay.

2 Christine King: What district?

3 Miguel Gabela: My – I'm in District 1, I am a candidate against this gentleman here in city of
4 Miami since February. And it appears that in this map that you've drawn up, my house is right
5 outside the district, what a coincidence. Can I see the map, maybe I'm talking out of line? That's
6 why I'd like to see the map and, uh, so I can determine whether my house has been intentionally
7 left outside the district, or whether it's in the district. If it's in the district, there's no problem, I
8 walk away, I'm not going to give any speech. Can I – can somebody tell me, 1111 NW 17th Court,
9 Miami, Florida 33125, 1701 NW South River Drive. I've been there for 23 years, I need to know
10 if my house is there. I am a contender, candidate, uh, since February of this year, walking, knocking
11 on doors against this gentleman here, with all due respect. And I just need to know if my house
12 has been left intentionally outside the district or not. If it's in the district I have no problem ma'am,
13 I will turn away and walk away.

14 Christine King: Hold on one second let me get you –

15 Miguel Gabela: Can somebody find out for me please?

16 Christine King: Um, where is attorney?

17 Miguel Gabela: Because I don't want to give you a speech for no reason if my house is in the
18 district and waste your time.

19 Nicholas Warren: It's moved.

20 Christine King: Did Mr. De Grandy leave the building?

21 Miguel Gabela: It's moved to District 3, what a coincidence it's moved to District 3, wow.
22 Okay, now I do have a speech to say.

23 Christine King: Wait, wait, let me get from the consultants.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel Gabela: Okay, okay.

2 Christine King: Victoria.

3 Victoria Méndez: I – we will, we will go find Mr. De Grandy, Mr. Gabela, we’ll go find him
4 and if you could just go wait a moment and –

5 Miguel Gabela: No, no I’d like to say my speech because I know you’re going to –

6 Victoria Méndez: Okay.

7 Miguel Gabela: – find him and he’s going to give me excuses why he left me out and I think
8 this is done intentionally by this gentleman here because –

9 Christine King: Okay, sir, sir.

10 Miguel Gabela: Yes ma’am. Can I give my speech and I’ll be out of here?

11 Christine King: No let me, let me – maybe you don’t need to give your speech.

12 Miguel Gabela: Okay.

13 Christine King: Let us see and then if so –

14 Miguel Gabela: But have you seen the map? Have you seen where my house is?

15 Christine King: Yes. I’m –

16 Miguel Gabela: Have you seen –

17 Christine King: I don’t – sir I –

18 Miguel Gabela: Have you seen the map and my house is?

19 Christine King: – sir, this is the first –

20 Miguel Gabela: What a coincidence.

21 Christine King: Sir this is the first.

22 Miguel Gabela: What a coincidence that I’m a candidate against this –

23 Christine King: Sir.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel Gabela: – gentleman and my house is left out. What? My house is –

2 [Audio is silenced]

3 Victoria Méndez: – a moment to find this.

4 Christine King: Mr. De Grandy could you please pull up the map so we can confirm. Thank
5 you.

6 Christine King: Good morning.

7 Fleta Stamen: Good morning. My name is Fleta Stamen, I'm a longtime resident of Coconut
8 Grove and I'm at 3078 Aviation Avenue, Coconut Grove, Florida. I'm also a native of Miami. And
9 I would just like to ask you all to please preserve and put back together the 30 neighborhoods that
10 were divided. And also I would like to stress that each of us needs to be fully represented by a
11 commissioner. But I would also like to point out today, I'm not used to coming to these hearings
12 except on this particular matter which I find very important. And I'm stunned that we're getting
13 maps from two different groups at this in the audience. We didn't even get your map. So it's very
14 hard to respond appropriately without the information in our hands and I would like to request that.

15 Christine King: I understand. As the plaintiffs said, they were working on these maps until 8
16 o'clock last night, so were our consultants. I just got the map this morning.

17 Fleta Stamen: Right.

18 Christine King: So, it's not that we are not trying to get the information, they were working,
19 both sides, diligently, late into the late last night.

20 Fleta Stamen: No, no, I respect that but maybe we need another hearing so we have an
21 opportunity –

22 Christine King: I don't think we have time.

23 Fleta Stamen: – to respond.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: We, we are on a tight deadline imposed by the court.

2 Fleta Stamen: But that kind of –

3 Victoria Méndez: Here's a copy –

4 Leida Steimann: – puts the –

5 Victoria Méndez: – a copy of the –

6 Fleta Stamen: No, I accept that but, you know, it just cuts us out of the process and we're the
7 constituents. That's all I'd like to mention. But thank you.

8 Christine King: Thank you. Good morning.

9 Andrés Althabe: Morning. Andrés Althabe, 1900 North Bayshore. Uh, you all know me. I've
10 been, uh, before this commission many times and I appreciate the wordes of the new officers of
11 BNA saying that, in the last 10 years we have accomplished many things. Because, uh, in those 10
12 years, I was the president of BNA, uh, getting those accomplishments. I don't have any doubt on
13 the good intentions of the commissioners when they approved the last map in March of 2022. But
14 they were – you accomplished something and it's that nobody liked it. Especially in Coconut
15 Grove, which is a neighborhood where people have lived there for 30 years, it has a history as a
16 community, and is probably the only one, neighborhood, that has that kind of history. Second
17 would be Brickell. And I have been advocating for keeping Edgewater and Omni together, but that
18 doesn't mean that necessarily on District 2. Everybody agrees that District 2 has to be reduced and
19 this last map that came from, uh, bad to worse, uh, they keep – they just take out of District 2
20 Morningside. And they keep on District 2 the most affluent people in the city. Well, I don't think
21 that is the philosophy of anybody, especially it didn't seem to have been the philosophy of this
22 lawsuit. The philosophy was, uh, diversification and integration in every district. Uh, I don't blame
23 anybody because they, uh, they had not been participating. The Edgewater has probably more

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 connection to Wynwood than to other districts. So my message is definitely to integrate Coconut
2 Grove again and, uh, don't try to, uh, keep all the most affluent people in the coast in District 2
3 when there's a history of Edgewater working together, especially with Wynwood and the Design
4 District. So I think that is my message. Keep Omni and Edgewater together, definitely keep
5 Coconut Grove together. And Omni and Edgewater, I think it would be a much more smooth
6 integration to District 5, then keep complaining that the District 2 commissioner doesn't do
7 anything for us. Because it's ridiculously large. Thank you.

8 Christine King: Thank you. Good morning.

9 Nathan Kurland: Good morning, Nathan Kurland, 3132 Day Avenue. I was thinking today
10 about a riddle that I heard. The riddle goes like this, what do you call 14 rabbits walking
11 backwards? And the answer is, a receding hairline. And what I noticed about this particular
12 discussion is that we seem to be going backward. The plaintiffs [holding up plaintiffs' map] gave
13 us easily to understand map of what they are recommending for our districts. The city gave us
14 nothing but maps we couldn't even see from the seats in this auditorium. That's backwards. Las
15 Vegas already has a line on how late the city commission of Miami will meet. I lost, I bet on the
16 under and it was on the over. Backwards. Changing our communities as Mr. Parrish mentioned,
17 changing the neighborhoods which change our communities make for a population that really, you
18 know, separates itself from the governing body of the city of Miami; backwards. Commissioners,
19 it is time to move forward. The fact that we don't even get to see a map on the fact, you know, by
20 the city, is making this public comment kind of moronic. We're supposed to be talking intelligently
21 about a map we can't see and we don't even know what it says. Mr. De Grandy did as good a job
22 as he could but, again, if the plaintiffs can do this, why can't the city? We believe the neighborhood
23 should stay the same, and certainly, and I really don't understand why a third of the city's

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 presentation had to do with who voted for Biden, who voted for this. I understand that we can't
2 have committee – we can't have districts based on race, but we also can't have districts based on
3 who's voting for who. Thank you very much.

4 Christine King: Thank you.

5 Nathan Kurland: Keep neighborhoods together, keep Coconut Grove together.

6 Christine King: Thank you. Victoria, do we have the answer to the question?

7 Joe Carollo: What question?

8 Christine King: Where's his house?

9 Miguel Gabela: May I speak?

10 Christine King: No, not yet.

11 Chris Johnson: May I madam chair? Yes, so the lines between those districts runs along a canal
12 and the property the gentleman showed me is on the eastern side of the canal in the District 3.

13 Todd Hannon: Chair, can I have the speaker's name sir? Sir if you just –

14 Chris Johnson: Oh I'm sorry, I beg your pardon. My name is Chris Johnson, I am here is as
15 the, uh, part of the presentation.

16 Joe Carollo: Chris, since I have you up here, where – if we could put that map up here again.
17 Where is 17th Avenue here? I'm a little lost with this map and the boundaries. What I have is very
18 small to – And maybe if you could kind of draw it and we could see it.

19 Chris Johnson: So this is the map zoomed in to the –

20 Joe Carollo: Right.

21 Chris Johnson: – area the gentleman was asking about.

22 Joe Carollo: Right.

23 Chris Johnson: The –

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Joe Carollo: Where was 17th Avenue, please?

2 Chris Johnson: 17th Avenue runs along – trying to get the mouse and show you. Sorry
3 commissioner, I’m trying to get the mouse to show. 17th Avenue runs, if you look at the – where
4 the road intersects the river, that’s 17th Avenue.

5 Joe Carollo: Could you write with a magic marker in there so we could all see it up here? Is it
6 possible?

7 Chris Johnson: One moment, commissioner.

8 Joe Carollo: Thank you.

9 [Laptop Beep]

10 Chris Johnson: So this is 17th Avenue, commissioner.

11 Joe Carollo: Where at?

12 Chris Johnson: I’m going to make the line brighter. That would be 17th Avenue.

13 Joe Carollo: Oh, okay. Way –

14 Chris Johnson: Right there.

15 Joe Carollo: – way over there.

16 Chris Johnson: This is a –

17 Joe Carollo: I was looking to the right.

18 Chris Johnson: – canal, it runs along that section right along there.

19 Joe Carollo: I see. So that’s 17th Avenue there. So 7th Street is right almost at the tip there.
20 Oh, right above where you got the circle at the bottom, correct, on the line?

21 Chris Johnson: I beg your pardon commissioner?

22 Joe Carollo: NW 7th Street is right above where you have the circle?

23 Chris Johnson: That is correct. This is NW 7th Street.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Joe Carollo: Okay. All right. And – Sorry. Can – madam, madam chair, can I take him lower
2 into the district to ask him a question now or should I wait for later?

3 Christine King: We should – we should wait.

4 Joe Carollo: Okay. All right. That’s fine, thank you.

5 Christine King: Sir go ahead.

6 Miguel Gabela: Thank you ma’am. My name is Miguel Angel Gabela, 1701 NW South River
7 Drive, Miami, Florida, 33125, for the record. It has now, uh, become evident, uh, that my house,
8 1111 NW 17th Court, Miami, Florida, 33125 and 1701 NW South River Drive, which is a vacant
9 land adjacent to my house, which I have lived there for 23 years, as my residence along with my
10 wife and my daughters, homesteaded for 23 years. I run in 2019 against this gentleman here, and
11 I was the runner up. I am – been running since February, okay? This is quite obvious that this is a
12 political move on somebody’s behalf. This will not stand, there is case law about this. I was warned
13 about this on Saturday morning. I was warned about this on Saturday morning, I couldn’t believe
14 that somebody would be capable of doing this obvious. Because if you look at that map, you will
15 see that I am the only one on that corner of the northeast, uh, the intersection, I am on the northeast
16 of the intersection right next to the 17th Avenue bridge. There’s no other house there, that’s my
17 house right there. So what a coincidence that you guys, or somebody decided that they were going
18 to cut it right there when it’s been there like that in the district for years since I first run in 2015,
19 okay? What I have to say, I know this is politically motivated, okay, and here’s – here’s what I’m
20 going to, I’m going to say. You, Mrs. King, Commissioner Covo, Commissioner King,
21 Commissioner Reyes, have the authority to stop this when it comes to the vote, okay? You don’t
22 need any more lawsuits in the city of Miami, you have enough right now, okay? Please, don’t do
23 this to me and don’t make me go out and get myself an attorney, okay, and have to sue the city

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 because I don't want to do this. Okay? Put me back, the remedy is, put me back as I was before so
2 I can continue running against this gentleman.

3 Christine King: Thank you.

4 Miguel Gabela: Okay, I haven't finished.

5 Christine King: No, your two minutes are up.

6 Miguel Gabela: Oh, my two minutes are up. I see.

7 Christine King: Thank you.

8 Miguel Gabela: Okay.

9 Christine King: Thank you.

10 Miguel Gabela: Thank you very much.

11 Christine King: Good morning.

12 Christi Tasker: Good morning commissioners, thank you very much for allowing public
13 comment. My name is Christi Tasker, I live at 150 SE 25th Road in the Roads. My district is not
14 – will remain District 2 no matter what. But what we've heard here is absolutely appalling and
15 could potentially cost the city a lot more money. Furthermore, it is gerrymandering. We've heard
16 even the city consultants state facts based on national elections, when all of you, sitting in the seats,
17 are supposed to be nonpartisan, working together. I simply ask that you keep the communities
18 together, furthermore avoid lawsuits. I don't know the gentleman that just spoke, but the reality is,
19 when you have someone running against Mr. de la Porta –

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Díaz

21 Christi Tasker: – Portilla. sorry, I apologize. Mr. de la Portilla.

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. Díaz de la Portilla. Yeah, yeah.

23 Christi Tasker: I'm not going to waste my two minutes trying to pronounce your name so I

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 apologize.

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's okay.

3 Christi Tasker: But regardless we need to make sure that we are keeping communities together
4 instead of dividing communities. District 2 needs to be further divided in terms of squaring it up,
5 very much like the ACLU maps are, and the lines need to be clean. Right now it looks like a divot
6 of a mess. You got – you've got little sections divoting down, and Ms. King I understand that you
7 are working on different portions, you know, throughout the city. And your district is rather large.
8 So I would just ask for you to consider working with the future commissioner of each district if it
9 happens to be divided so that we can keep the district nice, square and clean. Thank you very much.

10 Christine King: Thank you. Good morning.

11 Rose Pujol: Good morning. Rose Pujol, 2455 South Bayshore Drive. Commissioners,
12 chairman, I would like to say that you have heard from the community that obviously we'd like to
13 see the neighborhoods intact. That's, that's a – that's overwhelming, it's almost deafening. I would
14 not like to see what happened in Michigan in 2018 when they actually passed a commission
15 initiative that the legislature made the decision as to who would be representing the people. I ask
16 you, we know you, Commissioner Carollo in the middle of all your scrutiny, I really appreciate
17 that you took the time to take a look at that map and ask where this gentleman's address is.
18 Commissioner Alex DLP, I love, personally I love mischievous people and I understand where
19 you're coming from, but do the right thing, add him. It doesn't take much. Thank you to everybody.

20 Christine King: Thank you. Anyone else for public comment? Is there anyone else who would
21 like to speak on behalf of this redistricting process? Seeing none, the public comment period is
22 now closed. I am going to start with my vice chair, what – do you have any questions?

23 Joe Carollo: I – I do.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: Mr. De Grandy can you put the map up that we are working from?

2 Joe Carollo: Before I inquire into boundaries, because it's very small for me to figure out where
3 boundaries are at, I can't see avenues or streets.

4 Miguel De Grandy: Would you like me to blow up – blow up, uh, D3?

5 Joe Carollo: If you would to begin with.

6 Miguel De Grandy: Put the blow up of D3.

7 Joe Carollo: I'd appreciate it. But while you're doing that, chair, if I may say –

8 Christine King: Can you put the streets and the avenues on the map as well?

9 Miguel De Grandy: They would show if the plan is augmented enough.

10 Joe Carollo: Yeah.

11 Miguel De Grandy: It does show the streets.

12 Christine King: Okay.

13 Joe Carollo: While they're doing that, if I may make the following statement chair. Our
14 positions, whether commissioners or even the mayor of the city, they are and always have been,
15 nonpartisan positions; meaning we don't run by parties, we're nonpartisan. And I, for one, that's
16 the philosophy that I very strongly have followed, not to get into the petty politics of either parties,
17 or friend's parties. I've worked with everyone from both sides of the aisle, as they say, from both
18 parties, major parties, even other smaller parties. And I guess that's why I was able to win my
19 reelection, with a majority from Republicans, Democrats and independents. I've been very
20 nonpartisan. To me, some of the things that I've heard here are what clearly have been described
21 as.

22 The area of my district, we went up already so I know now where 17th Avenue is going. On
23 the new border with District 4, between District 4 and District 3, what avenue is that?

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Chris Johnson: May I commissioner?

2 Joe Carollo: Yes sir.

3 Chris Johnson: So the western border is 32nd Avenue, the far western border. The northern
4 border is 8th Street.

5 Joe Carollo: Right I'm – then I'm going down.

6 Chris Johnson: And this border is, um –

7 Joe Carollo: What avenue is that?

8 Chris Johnson: I believe that is 4th. Let me double check.

9 Joe Carollo: No, no, it can't be 4th.

10 Miguel De Grandy: 14th, I believe.

11 Joe Carollo: It could be 14th, I don't know.

12 Chris Johnson: It's, uh,

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It could be 16th

14 Victoria Méndez: Or 4th Avenue.

15 Chris Johnson: 14th, 14th, I –

16 Joe Carollo: It's 14th Avenue?

17 Chris Johnson: Yes commissioner.

18 Joe Carollo: Okay, now as –

19 Victoria Méndez: Wait, I'm sorry. Are we looking at the yellow, commissioner?

20 Joe Carollo: Yeah, between the yellow and the blue.

21 Victoria Méndez: The blue, right.

22 Joe Carollo: So –

23 Victoria Méndez: So that should be 4th Avenue because the next one says 3rd Avenue.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Joe Carollo: No, no, no, no, no, no, that's got to be 14th Avenue.

2 Chris Johnson: It's 14th, yeah.

3 Joe Carollo: That's no –

4 Chris Johnson: There's –

5 Joe Carollo: – 4th Avenue there.

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 14th Avenue.

7 Chris Johnson: 14th. This is 14th.

8 Joe Carollo: Yeah. Now, you have 8th Street and then it cuts up at 14th Avenue, correct?

9 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

10 Chris Johnson: Correct commissioner.

11 Joe Carollo: Now, coming down where it kind of does like a triangle at the bottom, where does
12 it – do the extreme part of the triangle? So that's 16th Avenue?

13 Chris Johnson: So this is 3rd Avenue, that curves along here, the blocks are shaped irregularly.

14 Joe Carollo: Right.

15 Chris Johnson: So it comes down to 3rd and then runs along 3rd to Dixie Highway.

16 Joe Carollo: Okay so that yeah, that's what we call 3rd Avenue. Um, the, um, down here, okay,
17 where would Coral Way be? Just up a little bit?

18 Chris Johnson: The far western boundary?

19 Joe Carollo: Yeah.

20 Chris Johnson: Yeah, I'm sorry, I don't under – were you asking me to –

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Point it with the little thing.

22 Chris Johnson: Right here?

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, 22nd Street. Go down.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Chris Johnson: 22nd is right here.

2 Joe Carollo: 22nd is Coral Way, just up a little bit.

3 Chris Johnson: Right here.

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, that's an avenue. Avenues go –

5 Chris Johnson: Oh, sorry.

6 Joe Carollo: No.

7 Chris Johnson: Right.

8 Joe Carollo: In the bottom.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Go down. Go down, down, down, down, there you go.

10 Chris Johnson: 22nd Street is right here commissioner.

11 Joe Carollo: Yeah. Okay. Um, Miguel, this area between 22nd Street/Coral Way, then on the
12 left as we look at it, is 17th Avenue that goes all the way to US 1 and then back to the district
13 border. That little square there that divides that part of Silver Bluff even more, where we just
14 invested some significant amounts in a park, how many people does that little square have? Can't
15 be that many.

16 Miguel De Grandy: I'd have to actually run the program, but we can get you those numbers.

17 Joe Carollo: Yeah, but, what I want to be able is, whatever we do, we – we could do it today.

18 Miguel De Grandy: Yes. No, absolutely. We could – we take a break whenever you want
19 commissioners.

20 Joe Carollo: And can you get those numbers in that minute square, if we can? You see what
21 I'm pointing to?

22 Manolo Reyes: Yes. You are – you are

23 Joe Carollo: The park is right on the other side.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Manolo Reyes: That's right. You're talking about Silver Bluff.

2 Joe Carollo: Well, yeah, it's –

3 Manolo Reyes: The, uh –

4 Joe Carollo: The other side of Silver Bluff because now we're dividing it, yes, into even more.

5 Manolo Reyes: Yes. That's right. And I also have a comment also on this, now that you mention
6 it. You're taking the, District 4 out west to 14th Avenue, that will cut also from District 1, which
7 is Little Havana, Domino Park, you see?

8 Joe Carollo: Not really. 14th Avenue it's fine because Domino Park is really from –

9 Manolo Reyes: 15.

10 Joe Carollo: – 9th Street. 15th Avenue.

11 Manolo Reyes: 15th Avenue.

12 Joe Carollo: Yeah. And it goes from 9th Street to 8th Street the – what we call Domino Plaza.

13 Manolo Reyes: That's right, Domino Plaza, but it's cut from the District 3 in this map?

14 Joe Carollo: I don't believe so.

15 Manolo Reyes: Yes sir.

16 Joe Carollo: Because, well, you're not – because the plaza still goes from 9th Street to 8th
17 Street.

18 Manolo Reyes: From 9th to 8th. But, it is on, it is on 15th Avenue.

19 Joe Carollo: It's 15 but it will go from 8th Street to –

20 Manolo Reyes: What I'm trying to say commissioner –

21 Joe Carollo: – 15th, yes.

22 Manolo Reyes: – is that I – my belief is, uh, that Domino Park should be part of District 3,
23 Little Havana.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Joe Carollo: Well, the – that would be simple. We could just, in that same line as before, where
2 the cut was 9th Street, leave it at 9th Street.

3 Manolo Reyes: Leave it in 9th Street, okay. That's right.

4 Joe Carollo: You know, I, I find, uh, where the commissioner, I'm glad you pointed that out,
5 these are small, minute tweaks that don't matter much in population, uh, basis. Um, but – so Mr.
6 De Grandy, on the bottom, so that we could see what we're doing, down in Silver Bluff, that little
7 square that we mentioned –

8 Manolo Reyes: Yeah.

9 Joe Carollo: – from 22nd Street/Coral Way down 17th –

10 Manolo Reyes: Mm-hmm.

11 Joe Carollo: – you know, back into the district, 17th to US 1, to the district, if you could figure
12 out how many people we have there. And then on the top, from your cut on 14th Avenue that you
13 made, instead of bringing it all the way to 8th Street, if you could maybe bring it to 9th Street up,
14 uh, until 17th Avenue.

15 Manolo Reyes: Yep.

16 Joe Carollo: A little less.

17 Manolo Reyes: So we can keep, uh –

18 Joe Carollo: Yeah.

19 Manolo Reyes: Okay.

20 Joe Carollo: 9th Street to 17th Avenue. That would be part. From 5th – from 14th to 17th
21 Avenue.

22 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

23 Joe Carollo: 8th Street to 9th Street. It's a minute amount of population.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel De Grandy: Of course.

2 Joe Carollo: I doubt it if you have more than 50 people living there but –

3 Manolo Reyes: Yep.

4 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

5 Joe Carollo: The other question that I would have, down in the bottom across US 1, what you
6 did, it stops at the expressway there, going into Virginia Key in Key Biscayne?

7 Miguel De Grandy: Basically, yes.

8 Joe Carollo: The little strip where, I don't know if my eyesight, I can't see it. But where District
9 3 would end, from there to Simpson Park –

10 Miguel De Grandy: You're looking north.

11 Joe Carollo: Yeah in – way in the bottom.

12 Miguel De Grandy: – south of US 1.

13 Joe Carollo: Way in the bottom to the right.

14 Miguel De Grandy: North and south of US 1.

15 Joe Carollo: Yeah. There's a little strip where South Miami Avenue is so that you make it more
16 square. If you could figure out in that little strip how many people you have, I would estimate you
17 have somewhere between 200 to 300 people that live there. Because those are very large lots
18 compared to others.

19 Miguel De Grandy: To get to Simpson Park?

20 Joe Carollo: Yeah, to get to Simpson Park. Between South Miami Avenue, the boundary line,
21 the, that you have for the district and the two points, Simpson Park and where you had ended the
22 district as you turn into Virginia Key. And then over 3rd Avenue, which is Coral Way, the other
23 side of Simpson Park, that little strip that's in District 2, um, that goes up to a strip that's been in

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 my district, how many voters do we have in that strip?

2 Miguel De Grandy: That's probably more dense.

3 Joe Carollo: Yeah, that's more dense. That's why I'm inquiring that –

4 Miguel De Grandy: I mean –

5 Joe Carollo: – that little strip on 3rd to –

6 Miguel De Grandy: Maybe a couple thousand.

7 Joe Carollo: Um, think it'd be less than that but, you know.

8 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

9 Joe Carollo: That's why I'm asking you to run it to see what we have. To there. Um –

10 Miguel De Grandy: We'll run all the numbers on that.

11 Joe Carollo: Yeah and last but not least, you have from 27th to 22nd. You know, when we talk
12 about the Grove, and I've lived here and I've lived in this city for a lot longer than a lot of the
13 people that I've been hearing from. When you talk about the Grove, you're talking about different
14 neighborhoods. I know the – it sounds great, One Grove, but you're talking about different people,
15 different neighborhoods. And let me start all the way to the end. The area where Stallone and
16 Madonna used to live in, South Miami Avenue. That was a Grove into itself. Then you cut across
17 the street from Vizcaya, and you look at Bay Heights, that's a different Grove.

18 Miguel De Grandy: It's a walled in neighborhood.

19 Joe Carollo: Yeah. They even pay for their own security there. Then you go across 17th Avenue
20 to 22nd Avenue, you got some of the biggest lots that you have in the whole city of Miami and
21 certainly I will say the biggest lots that are not in the bay in the whole city, in that section there.
22 That's very different than when you go across 22nd Avenue to 27th Avenue, that now the homes
23 are reduced in lots, they're not as expensive and it's a very changing area, from what I've been

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 seeing. Frankly, you have a lot more Hispanics moving in there, with younger families and so on
2 and, they're fixing up the older homes there, and making them a lot more expensive. Then from
3 27th Avenue, when you go into the Center Grove, that's totally different than all the other areas
4 that I mentioned. You have more townhouses, a lot of townhouses, you have more apartments.
5 Then, you go into the South Grove and you get into, again, very expensive areas. And you take
6 that South Grove almost, almost to Cocoplum, that's a whole different Grove than the rest that I
7 described. And last but not least, you go into the, what we now have named Little Havana, the old
8 Black Grove, and it's very different. And that's changing every week as we speak because it's
9 being gentrified like there's no tomorrow in that area. So what we call Coconut Grove, you have
10 many, many different communities within that Grove, that have major differences, in, in many
11 ways, in more ways than I've described here, and you also have certain similarities like you do
12 with any community. Having said that, I'm just trying to get numbers from you. On the part where
13 you –

14 Miguel De Grandy: Chris.

15 Joe Carollo: – cut the grove, beginning in 27th –

16 Miguel De Grandy: Well, let me wait –

17 Joe Carollo: – down to 22nd –

18 Miguel De Grandy: Let me wait until it's on the –

19 Joe Carollo: Yeah.

20 Miguel De Grandy: – on the screen.

21 Joe Carollo: If you could give me numbers also and how many people live there.

22 Victoria Méndez: That's it. [inaudible 1:24:19]

23 Joe Carollo: Okay. And then if you would come down – in other words this whole area that

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 you did, the full amount of people that live there and then if you would come down Aviation, 27th
2 through Aviation where you make it a little tighter. The other side of Aviation is practically very
3 few homes. It's – in other words you're going to give me amounts of people in the square that you
4 did there from 27th to 22nd. And then you're going to make it even tighter, from 27 you cut on
5 Aviation to 22nd, a second one. Do you follow me Miguel what I'm asking?

6 Miguel De Grandy: I'll, yeah, I'll certainly look at the map and –

7 Joe Carollo: Yeah, the one on Aviation is just going to make it a little lesser in population.

8 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

9 Joe Carollo: That's all and –

10 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

11 Joe Carollo: – when we break, if we could see that then.

12 Victoria Méndez: So commissioner, your main concerns were to keep certain communities
13 together and certain neighborhoods together with regard to that as well and you need just some
14 questions on numbers.

15 Joe Carollo: I'm asking just for numbers now.

16 Victoria Méndez: Okay, thank you.

17 Joe Carollo: So that I could see shifts. The area that I did express a concern was –

18 Victoria Méndez: Well he'll, he'll give us numbers in the break and then we'll talk about it.

19 Joe Carollo: Yeah, sure.

20 Victoria Méndez: Thank you.

21 Joe Carollo: Thank you.

22 Miguel De Grandy: And we've had – I'm happy to do that and we'll come back to you with
23 numbers. We've had other commissioners also make requests for review of plans. I know

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Commissioner Diaz la Portilla has proposed an alternative we found to be compliant.
2 Commissioner Covo sent me a couple, one I couldn't evaluate but the other I could, and gave her
3 my response that that was also constitutionally compliant. So we're happy to review any –

4 Christine King: So that is exactly what we – I'd like for us to get all of our comments out and
5 then take a break for lunch.

6 Miguel De Grandy: Yes ma'am.

7 Christine King: Have you work on it to present and then we can come back and vote.
8 Commissioner Covo do you have –

9 Sabina Covo: Yes I do. I am extremely confused with the presentation because, as I expressed
10 as we were going back and forth with this situation, I am an advocate of keeping the identity of
11 Coconut Grove together. I do understand Commissioner's Carollo's point, that it's very diverse,
12 but I think the city as a whole is very diverse. And what I'm seeing in District 2, which is the
13 district that I represent with a lot of effort because it's very diverse, is that we're splitting Coconut
14 Grove and we're splitting Morningside. Those two are neighborhoods that have been together, that
15 are historic. Not – it doesn't matter how much they're changing in many ways because the whole
16 city is changing. And probably in ten years we're going to be going through this with a totally
17 different map because we're very multicultural. So I would like to see the same breakdown, please,
18 that you presented for the other two districts for District 2. Because I do understand that District
19 2, because it's the one going vertical – and it's going to continue to go vertical because we have
20 the zoning for that. We are overpopulated. So I do understand that we need changes, I just want to
21 make sure that the changes that we have represent the community. Because, as commissioners, we
22 are the ones that draw the lines, right? But we are the voice for our community. And what my
23 community has expressed to me is that they want to keep Coconut Grove together. So it's tough,

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 you know, trying to see the emails, listen to what they think. And also as a commissioner I think
2 that the type of service that we could give, if the districts look alike, of course is much, much
3 better. So that would be my request.

4 Miguel De Grady: Yes ma'am. And I think you can confirm, I did speak with your chief of
5 staff yesterday, I did give him my analysis of your map Alternative 1. The overall deviation was in
6 the six point something, which is within constitutional parameters. So if you'd like us to, you
7 know, basically model that and give you a photocopy of it and you can present it, that's fine, you're
8 absolutely correct. I'm just here to make proposals, I don't make the decisions, you all will make
9 those decisions, so I'm happy to present, you know, to give you a copy of your plan so you could
10 present it. We'll also put it on the board. Whatever Commissioner Carollo, you know, has
11 requested we will model that. I know Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla has a version that we've
12 been able to look at also like we did with yours. And we will come back after the break and tell
13 you, here's our proposal, here's the different alternatives and you all are elected to make that
14 decision, not me.

15 Christine King: Now, did I hear that you split Morningside? No?

16 Miguel De Grandy: Yes, Morn –

17 Sabina Covo: Morningside is split in this map.

18 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah.

19 Christine King: Into D5?

20 Miguel De Grandy: Half of Morningside goes into D5, half of Morningside is on the, uh –

21 Christine King: Okay. So up to last night, I did not get a briefing on that. I did not know that
22 Morningside – I was getting half of Morningside. So I would have something to say about that.

23 Miguel De Grandy: What would you like? Would you like to see a plan with all of Morningside

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 in your district?

2 Christine King: No, I don't think that any of Morningside should go to my district. Wouldn't
3 that be splitting up neighborhoods?

4 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

5 Christine King: I mean, not that I don't love Morningside. Don't –

6 [Laughter]

7 Christine King: – don't get me wrong. And I'm in Morningside all the time. They are my
8 neighbors but I, you know, [looking at Commissioner Covo] is that what you want?

9 Miguel De Grandy: Commissioner Covo's plan – well, do you permit me to comment on it?

10 Sabina Covo: Of course.

11 Manolo Reyes: Well I haven't –

12 Miguel Grandy: Commissioner Covo's

13 Manolo Reyes: – excuse me, I haven't seen her map.

14 Christine King: Right I haven't see –

15 Miguel De Grandy: Right.

16 Christine King: Well –

17 Manolo Reyes: I want to know what she's –

18 Christine King: – I haven't seen –

19 Manolo Reyes: – and we will not –

20 Christine King: I haven't seen her map and I had –

21 Manolo Reyes: And, uh, and, uh, if –

22 Sabina Covo: I – just, um, I love Morningside, I've been working super hard, not only in my
23 few 100 days but when I was campaigning. But when we were trying to see what would make

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 sense, madam chair, we noticed that of course our district is overpopulated. So we felt, okay, if the
2 sense of the community and even of the plaintiff was to keep Coconut Grove together, it wouldn't
3 make sense to split Morningside, and that's what this plan is doing, splitting Morningside. If I was
4 for me, I wouldn't lose any of the – my neighborhoods. I love my constituents and I've been
5 working hard towards all of them. But I do understand that I'm the district that has more population
6 and we need to be fair. And I also understand that, again, this should be based on the right of the
7 people to vote and population as well, not only – I just don't get the partisan topic and, and it's
8 just not, not good.

9 Miguel De Grandy: All right. Now, if I understand –

10 Manolo Reyes: I, I, I have a question. I have a question.

11 Miguel De Grandy: Can I clarify for a second?

12 Manolo Reyes: Uh, sure, sure. Sure.

13 Miguel De Grandy: If I understand, Commissioner Covo's plan would seek to put Morningside
14 into D5. What you're telling me is you want Morningside in D2. Do I understand that correctly?

15 Christine King: Yes. I'd like to see the impact of the proposal –

16 Sabina Covo: And me as well, madam chair, me as well. It's not that I want to put it in her
17 district –

18 Christine King: You know, um –

19 Sabina Covo: – I just want to see the difference.

20 Miguel De Grandy: All right, I'll show you and then you'll see the numbers.

21 Sabina Covo: See, see the difference.

22 Christine King: This is –

23 Sabina Covo: It's just something that makes sense.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: – Morningside is in this [holding up De Grandy draft map] – because in the
2 map that I received last night, I don't believe that Morningside was in my district.

3 Sabina Covo: No, it's split.

4 Miguel De Grandy: So there's [inaudible 01:32:25].

5 Christine King: See that's because it doesn't have streets, that can't –

6 Miguel De Grandy: [inaudible 01:32:31] was here, [inaudible 01:32:33]. So it's [inaudible
7 01:32:35].

8 Christine King: No, no, my house was never in Morningside. My house is not in Morningside,
9 my house is on 62nd Street.

10 Sabina Covo: So what –

11 Christine King: – natural border of D5.

12 Miguel De Grandy: Okay, [inaudible 01:32:47]. Okay.

13 Victoria Méndez: So just to be clear, I believe that Commissioner Covo wanted to keep
14 Morningside in District 2. That was your direction and you want to see the numbers?

15 Miguel De Grandy: The directions that she asked, if I understand it correctly, is to put
16 Morningside, together, into D5.

17 Sabina Covo: So technically what we proposed was to analyze how that will look. So I'm not
18 redrawing it finally, I just want to make sure what makes more sense to keep the neighborhoods
19 together. I just think that for District 2 to have Coconut Grove divided and Morningside divided,
20 doesn't make sense.

21 Miguel De Grandy: Okay so we will present –

22 Christine King: But I don't think there was ever an effort to divide Morningside, correct? At
23 least not in any of our conversations.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah. I – there’s not a conscious effort, commissioner, to divide any
2 community, it’s all driven by numbers and the need to equalize. But just to be clear because I want
3 to be responsive to every commissioner, you want the plan consistent with the Map 1 you sent me?
4 Would that be correct?

5 Sabina Covo: Yes, but of course if you provide different numbers we can also analyze it. That’s
6 why we’re here –

7 Miguel De Grandy: Of course.

8 Sabina Covo: – because it was also until 8:00 p.m. yesterday. This morning I hadn’t seen any
9 plan. That’s the whole situation. We need to make clear where we’re heading.

10 Miguel De Grandy: Sure. Sure, I got your plans yesterday so all I could do is respond by
11 yesterday.

12 Christine King: So can you give us a copy of each of our maps?

13 Miguel De Grandy: If, if you all release them –

14 Christine King: And we’ll take a recess.

15 Miguel De Grandy: Commissioner Covo has told me that she has no problem releasing her
16 plan so I could model it and release it. Now, to tell you what I mean by modeling is, Commissioner
17 Covo’s plan delineates her district. Now, I can see, by the way she’s delineated her district, that it,
18 it involves changes between these districts but doesn’t impact the others. So when I responded to
19 her chief of staff I said, I assume other than these changes, you’re not impacting the other districts.
20 If that’s correct, I can model that plan, which means I can give her a five-district plan that has all
21 the numbers based on where she would like the lines drawn in D2. So we’ve –

22 Sabina Covo: Exactly. And we also have other lines that we had changed that my chief of staff
23 is telling me, but at the same time, what I wanted to say is that my main request was to see what

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 works for everyone and how we can keep the neighborhoods integrated. I reiterate this because the
2 attorneys came to our office and said, “What’s your priority?” So it’s not like we’re just coming
3 out with a definite plan, we’re just seeing the priorities of our constituents. So it’s not about, this
4 is the final plan that she drew, no. I want to make sure that what I’m doing is aligned to what my
5 constituents are petitioning, if the numbers, and of course under the Constitution, make sense.

6 Miguel De Grandy: Yes, yes. And –

7 Sabina Covo: It’s not that I want to – I don’t want to lose any of the neighborhoods, I love my
8 district, but I do understand that I’m the most conflicting district because it’s the one that is
9 growing. It has 75 perce – probably more than 75% of the taxes so, I mean, I’m willing to work.

10 Miguel De Grandy: Understood. To your comment about the second plan, let me explain to
11 you why I couldn’t give your chief of staff an opinion on that plan. That plan drew the lines for
12 District 2, but changed the lines for District 3 and did not contain lines for the other three districts.
13 And so, I cannot tell you whether the overall deviation complies with the constitution, et cetera,
14 because to do that I would have to have five drawn districts. Now, once you reconfigure District
15 3, I’m not the one that can say, you’d like four this way, you’d like five this way, et cetera, it’s up
16 to you to tell me, “Here’s how I’d like the plan drawn.” And then I’m happy to generate the data
17 for you.

18 Sabina Covo: Thank you.

19 Miguel De Grandy: Sorry. Sorry, sorry.

20 Manolo Reyes: Madam chair, I heard that there is another map in the making, we are all in the
21 business of making maps. [Laughter]. I mean, I don’t know why we are hiring you man, you see,
22 we’re all making maps. So, I heard there is another map by Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla, I
23 would like to have a copy of it also, when we go to – if we are going to be analyzing all the maps,

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 you see.

2 Miguel De Grandy: Sir –

3 Manolo Reyes: Now –

4 Miguel De Grandy: If commissioner –

5 Christine King: I thought –

6 Manolo Reyes: – I will have – I will like a copy of commissioner copy – Covo and
7 Commissioner Diaz la Portilla, and anybody else that has a map, I would like to see it too.

8 Christine King: I thought this map was representative of all of our –

9 Manolo Reyes: Yes.

10 Christine King: I thought this was the map that you were working from that expressed –

11 Manolo Reyes: Absolutely, that's what I heard.

12 Christine King: – all of our priorities.

13 Victoria Méndez: Right. Version, so Version 12 is the only one that he initially crunched
14 numbers on to give a baseline –

15 Manolo Reyes: Okay.

16 Victoria Méndez: – and then it's a presentation for all of you to move around.

17 Christine King: Okay. So what I'd like to do is recess so that you can speak with all of us and
18 we could, we're working off of this map. You could speak with all of us, reiterate our priorities
19 and then we come back. So I'm proposing a three hour recess so we could grab a bit of lunch and
20 you have adequate time to meet with all of us so that we can come back and vote on a map.

21 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah. And here – here's what – I don't know that you can vote on a map,
22 I'm being realistic, commissioner. Because, if each one of you makes different tweaks, it's
23 impossible to, to generate all those into one map, some may be mutually exclusive. So this is what

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 I would suggest. You know, anyone that wants to present a plan, I'm happy to do the analysis, I'm
2 happy to tell you does it comply with the Constitution, and you can all pick from those versions
3 which map you would like.

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Madam chair, Version 14, which is the map that I put together. You've
5 already said on the record that it's constitutionally compliant, is that correct?

6 Miguel De Grandy: That's my understanding, yes.

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So there is no tweaking on that plan, that's already constitutionally
8 compliant, correct?

9 Miguel De Grandy: That would be your proposal, yes.

10 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: My proposal, yes sir.

11 Miguel De Grandy: And –

12 Joe Carollo: What, what, what is that?

13 Miguel De Grandy: And commissioner –

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's Version 14 which is – was submitted about a week ago, about
15 five days ago, and he's reviewed it and he's – that plan, I'm not changing anything else, that plan
16 itself was Version 14, it's constitutionally compliant. That's the only thing I'm interested in right
17 now in terms of the –

18 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – what the records should reflect.

20 Miguel De Grandy: Yes. As Commissioner Covo's is also constitutionally –

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That we may very well end up voting for a very tweaked – because
22 tweaking is tweaking and changing is changing, it's two different things, right? So it is a couple of
23 blocks, Domino Park, things of that nature, that could be a slight adaptation of Version 12, right?

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 So it's minor changes in Version 12. We'd also have the option available to us, to recess the
2 meeting at a particular juncture and come back tomorrow morning, we don't adjourn we re – well,
3 let me tell you what the options are. You can not if you want but I mean, we can.

4 Miguel De Grandy: I can't be here tomorrow morning. I'm –

5 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Well, you don't have to be here, he can be here. We have like seven
6 lawyers don't we?

7 Christine King: I can't be here tomorrow morning either.

8 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But you can answer – but you can answer a lot of the questions, right,
9 today, and then tomorrow's a different conversation, you know.

10 Miguel De Grandy: Absolutely.

11 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

12 Miguel De Grandy: But what I'll tell you is this, you know –

13 Manolo Reyes: Which version is this?

14 Christine King: Version 12.

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's Version 12. That's Version 12.

16 Miguel De Grandy: Version 12.

17 Christine King: Version 12. Which incorporates your Version 14?

18 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No.

19 Manolo Reyes: I haven't seen Version 14.

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No. No, no version –

21 Miguel De Grandy: Commissioners, commissioners, may I please –

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's two different versions – hold on a second. It's very simple. Version
23 12 is the city's map, the ones that takes into account everybody's input in different conversations

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 –

2 Sabina Covo: Not mine. Not mine.

3 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Well –

4 Sabina Covo: My input is not in this version.

5 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Well, okay, not yours. But my understanding is that it's been discussed

6 for about over a week in long meetings, different commissioners, independent on each other, right?

7 So that's Version 12, that's the plan that you presented to us today, is that correct?

8 Miguel De Grandy: That's correct.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. Version 14 is my version. We may very well not use that, that's
10 fine, it's the will of the body, right? But, you've already reviewed Version 14.

11 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And that's constitutionally compliant, correct?

13 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. The other tweaks that are going to happen in the break, that's a
15 different conversation for later. We may very well come back and debate Version 12 with some
16 minor adaptations. I agree with Commissioner Carollo, I think they both agree. What I heard is
17 that, you know, it should be probably 16th Avenue and not 14th Avenue, something like that. And
18 Domino Park stays in District, in District 3 if Commissioner Carollo, if I'm, if I'm phrasing your
19 position correctly.

20 Joe Carollo: Well –

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And you want to keep Domino Park, you've represented it, you've
22 invested a lot in it.

23 Joe Carollo: I believe Domino Park is still going to stay in the district. What Commissioner

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Reyes pointed out, rightly so, that Domino Plaza would then go towards 9th Street. So what we're
2 looking at is really from 15th Avenue to 17th Avenue, 9th Street.

3 Manolo Reyes: 9th Street.

4 Joe Carollo: Keeping it in District 3 like it was, you're looking maybe 50 people that live in
5 those two blocks.

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Well and that's what I meant, right –

7 Joe Carollo: And then the, the other area –

8 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – minor changes.

9 Joe Carollo: – the other area that I asked for the simple purpose of the park we're building, the
10 – that's about an acre or so in that part of Silver Bluff, to leave that section as it was, from Coral
11 Way, down 17th Avenue to the highway, and I can't imagine that you have more than 100 people
12 there or less. So between both areas that I'm talking about, maybe I'm guessing we have 150
13 people or so. Not much more than that, I don't think, certainly under 200. So –

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: What my understanding is –

15 Joe Carollo: – minute –

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: What my understanding, Commissioner Carollo and Chairwoman
17 King, what my understanding is that these are minor changes that can take place. I think, what I
18 heard here today, you're happy with the way it looks, Commissioner Carollo and Commissioner
19 Reyes share a boundary there, they can move around, it appears they're both happy with those
20 changes. I can live with Version 12 at the end of the day. So to me it's not, it wasn't been proposed,
21 so you know, that's four at least that I can hear, I know you [looking at Commissioner Covo] have
22 concerns of the Grove and obviously concerns will be, will be addressed and you have every right
23 to have those concerns. But we just need to vote out a map

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: Right.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So the city has a map to go to the courts and say, this is the official – because we don't have any official map. We don't have an official map here until this commission votes it out.

Christine King: Right.

Miguel De Grandy: Absolutely.

Christine King: So –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's not what anybody comes to us and presents, this is Version 1, 2, 3, to 14, we have to vote it out.

Christine King: So –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And by majority of the commission.

Christine King: So I'd like to take a recess.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

Miguel De Grandy: Well –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I have –

Miguel De Grandy; – I could just be clear –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – ribs, Commissioner Carollo, I made you happy because –

Miguel De Grandy: – as to what's been –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – I have ribs.

Christine King: I'm sorry –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Flanigan ribs in my office, you too, Flanigan ribs.

Christine King: What happened?

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Ribs.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel De Grandy: May I – may I be?

2 Christine King: Go ahead.

3 Miguel De Grandy: Okay. I just want to be clear as to what we can do and what we will do.
4 We will sit with each one of you, make whatever changes to the plan you need, I don't think you
5 need any. We will then publish, three hours from now –

6 Christine King: Yes.

7 Miguel De Grandy: – whatever you want to publish, three, four alternatives, it's your decision,
8 it's not my decision.

9 Christine King: Yes.

10 Miguel De Grandy: All I can do is give you the version.

11 Christine King: Understood.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And I, I do not need to meet with you. Now, you're going to miss out
13 on the ribs. That's your –

14 Christine King: Understood.

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – your loss.

16 Miguel De Grandy: It's a three – well, it's a three hour lunch so I –

17 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: You can come by.

18 Miguel De Grandy: – I may take you up on it.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I'll save you a rack. I'll save you a rack.

20 Christine King: We're in the – we're in recess –

21 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

22 Christine King: We will re – adjourn – we will return at 3:30. Can I see you in my office?

23 Manolo Reyes: 3:30 in the morning?

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel De Grandy: Right now?

2 Christine King: Right now. In the afternoon.

3 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

4 Sabina Covo: Uh, what time madam chair, 3:30?

5 Christine King: 3:30.

6
7 [Recess]

8
9 Christine King: Welcome back to the second half of the June 14th, 2023 redistricting hearing.
10 We are going to now begin, I believe our attorneys are printing, they're in the process of printing
11 the final maps or map; maps.

12 Victoria Méndez: Let me confirm.

13 Christine King: Okay. No, he told me that.

14 Victoria Méndez: Okay.

15 Christine King: So we're just waiting for, for us to get a copy of the versions that we discussed
16 during the break and prayerfully we will be ready to make a motion and a second and settle on a
17 map.

18 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Can we make the motion now?

19 Christine King: No.

20 Victoria Méndez: No, no there has to be a –

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: For the purpose of discussion?

22 Victoria Méndez: – a presentation. He has a little presentation, a mini presentation.

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But we can still make the motion now for the purpose of discussion,

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 right?

2 Victoria Méndez: Okay.

3 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right?

4 Christine King: Yes.

5 Manolo Reyes: Making a motion for what?

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: A motion for the Version 12 map that we've agreed to and everybody
7 has spoken to. And then we can discuss it.

8 Manolo Reyes: – see what's final –

9 Christine King: Yes, we need to see the final version of it.

10 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay.

11 Christine King: Here they come.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I thought we were reconvening the meeting because we had –
13 everybody was ready.

14 Manolo Reyes: Yes, but, uh –

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, right?

16 Christine King: Well, we were and then his –

17 Manolo Reyes: Map 12, through the chair, map 12, I think, that already had some additions
18 and subtraction, I think –

19 Christine King: I think –

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right, right, in the

21 Manolo Reyes: That's right –

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

23 Manolo Reyes: – as amended.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, that will –

2 Christine King: As amended.

3 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: As amended was the motion, really, yeah. But instead of waiting for
4 the maps to come in –

5 Joe Carollo: But remember, when you take out from one area, you got to make it up in another
6 so that's what we've got to see –

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Correct.

8 Joe Carollo: – what they have.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Correct.

10 Sabina Covo: So technically we're not going to see the other maps?

11 Christine King: Huh?

12 Sabina Covo: We're not going to see the other maps technically?

13 Christine King: If there's more than one we will see.

14 Sabina Covo: I have a different one that I would like you to see.

15 Christine King: We will see.

16 Sabina Covo: I would like you all to see.

17 Christine King: We will see. Whatever they have we will, we will all review. Good afternoon
18 guys.

19 Miguel De Grandy: Good afternoon.

20 Chris Johnson: Good afternoon madam chair.

21 Miguel De Grandy: We'll take a minute to load up. What we're going to do, we've set up a
22 PowerPoint with the five different alternatives for your consideration. Um –

23 Christine King: These are five alternatives of Version 12?

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel De Grandy: No ma'am, let me, let me –

2 Christine King: No.

3 Miguel De Grandy: – walk through.

4 Christine King: Okay.

5 Miguel De Grandy: Commissioner Reyes was satisfied with district – with Version 12 but
6 would like to hear from his colleagues. Commissioner Carollo had an alternative. Commissioner
7 King has an alternative –

8 Christine King: – of Version 12.

9 Miguel De Grandy: – of Version 12, yes.

10 Christine King: Uh-huh.

11 Miguel De Grandy: Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla has Version 14 and Commissioner
12 Sabina Covo also did a different version. So there are – there's four versions plus V12, that's five.

13 Christine King: Okay. So – but my version was from Version 12.

14 Miguel De Grandy: That is correct ma'am.

15 Christine King: And Commissioner Carollo's version is Version 12?

16 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

17 Joe Carollo: Yes.

18 Christine King: And your version [looking at Carollo] worked off of Version 12. So the three
19 of us [pointing to Carollo and Reyes] worked off of Version 12, he [pointing to Díaz de la Portilla]
20 has Version 14 –

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, I said before the break.

22 Christine King: He's with Version 12.

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: As amended.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: As amended.

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: We discussed over the break. So Version 14 remains as part of the
3 record as a constitutionally compliant map for future references. Remember, we vote on it today
4 but then we have to go to the – it's a judicial process in place, right? So I want to make sure that
5 on the record, he's already said it three times, that it's constitutionally compliant, Version 14.

6 Christine King: Okay.

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But I'm, but I'm okay with Version 12, as amended. I think, probably
8 we've all stated what we want, and I think Commissioner Covo has a totally different perspective
9 on what you want to do, but I think I'm okay with Version 12. I'm confident I'm okay with Version
10 12.

11 Christine King: Okay.

12 Miguel De Grandy: Okay, so –

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I think we're very –

14 Miguel De Grandy: Let me do this, let me walk you –

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – quickly come to consensus –

16 Miguel De Grandy: – through changes –

17 Christine King: Okay.

18 Miguel De Grandy: – in each version.

19 Christine King: Okay.

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No. Why not see the changes on Version 12.

21 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: See if people are okay with it.

23 Miguel De Grandy: Sure.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: We get the four votes or five votes and we're good to go. And not
2 waste people's times anymore, right?

3 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

4 Christine King: Okay. Ready for your presentation?

5 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right?

6 Christine King: Go ahead.

7 Manolo Reyes: I have a question, and that's to the attorney. Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla
8 says that he wants to, I mean, include in the record and that it is constitutional, right? But can the
9 judge use that map instead of the other one?

10 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No.

11 Victoria Méndez: I'm sorry, the version that, that he had suggested earlier, Version 14, you're
12 asking about that?

13 Manolo Reyes: Yes.

14 Victoria Méndez: Yes that's a, it's a constitutional map.

15 Manolo Reyes: Okay. But by including –

16 Victoria Méndez: But you have to vote on it.

17 Manolo Reyes: By including it in the record, could the judge say, "Okay, instead of the one
18 the you voted on, I am going to force this one."

19 Miguel De Grandy: The answer to your question, if I may, the judge is free to make an
20 independent determination. He may take any one of the five versions and he may elect to have a
21 special master draw his own plan. If and only if, he determines that whatever is voted on today is
22 constitutionally infirm. If what is voted on today he finds to be constitutionally compliant, then
23 that will be the map.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: But let me ask you, for the record, our versions, each version, is
2 constitutionally sound, correct?

3 Miguel De Grandy: Yes, each ver –

4 Christine King: Each version.

5 Miguel De Grandy: Each version is within the acceptable deviations, each version is available
6 for you all to debate and vote on.

7 Sabina Covo: And madam chair just to add, I want to make a clarification, my version was also
8 gotten from Map 12 –

9 Miguel De Grandy: That is correct.

10 Sabina Covo: – as well.

11 Christine King: Okay.

12 Sabina Covo: So it's also changes to Map 12 as well.

13 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah. All versions, basically –

14 Sabina Covo: Come from the –

15 Miguel De Grandy: – make changes to Version 12.

16 Christine King: Okay.

17 Miguel De Grandy: Okay?

18 Christine King: All right. Let's start with the presentations then.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But only one version is going to be voted on today probably ideally,
20 right? So that's fair, that's fair. So we vote on that one version as amended and that's the official
21 position of the city of Miami. Okay.

22 Miguel De Grandy: What I would envision is once I present the five versions, you all will
23 discuss, you all will debate. There will be a motion for one or more plans and, you know, eventually

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 whatever we choose majority support will be the plan.

2 Manolo Reyes: [inaudible 01:51:50].

3 Christine King: It's just like the last one.

4 Manolo Reyes: That's right. You see. I will like to see Version 12 with all the amendments that

5 –

6 Miguel De Grandy: Of course, yes.

7 Manolo Reyes: – that are presented.

8 Miguel De Grandy: I will walk through every version for you.

9 Manolo Reyes: Okay.

10 Miguel De Grandy: Okay?

11 Manolo Reyes: Okay.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Well, I'm not sure we need to do that, do we? You want to do it? You
13 want to walk through every version? Okay.

14 Christine King: It's only five.

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Only five.

16 Miguel De Grandy: Okay. On the screen is a draft version, you have seen that so I don't think
17 I need to discuss that. So let's go through –

18 Victoria Méndez: So for the record, just so that we're clear, the draft plan proposal –

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Is 12.

20 Victoria Méndez: – labeled right now is your original Version 12?

21 Miguel De Grandy: It's Version 12, which is the version –

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – without being, without it being amended.

23 Miguel De Grandy: – Commissioner Reyes said he is okay with but wants to listen to any other

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 changes.

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay.

3 Miguel De Grandy: So, for – I put it as a draft plan, like I just said, this is Commissioner Reyes’
4 plan but it is a draft plan.

5 Sabina Covo: When did the amendments to Version 12 happen? During the break? I have not
6 seen those so.

7 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah the amendment –

8 Christine King: You’ll see them now.

9 Miguel De Grandy: – all the changes have been – I have met with all of you, as I was directed
10 and I have made changes that –

11 Victoria Méndez: You’re going to see them now.

12 Miguel De Grandy: – each one of you –

13 Sabina Covo: Okay.

14 Miguel De Grandy: – have asked for. Okay, so let’s go to the next one. Okay. This is the
15 Version 14, this is the D1 alternative map, with a deviation of 2.3. It basically, you know, if I’m
16 going to explain it, it basically does some changes to D4, brings it down past US 1. It leaves most
17 of what was District 3 in the draft plan intact. District 1 stays intact. District 5 also stays intact.
18 No, District 5 actually, on the coast, comes down further in the – to the south, up to the 195, and
19 the overall deviation is 2%. I’ll go through each one and then if you have more questions on them
20 we’ll go back to them. So let’s go to the next alternative.

21 Okay, this is the D5 alternative. The D5 alternative leaves Districts 1, 3, and 4 intact. It makes
22 a change between District 5 and District 2 at the north coastal end to bring all of Morningside into
23 D2. Is that correctly stated? Okay.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: It puts Morningside back in D2.

Miguel De Grandy: Yes. All right, so let's go to the next one. And it has a deviation of 3.4%, way within constitutional parameters.

Okay, this is the D3 alternative map. It has a deviation of 3.5. It also puts Morningside back into D2. So it is the same D5 as Commissioner King has configured. D1 was not touched. There are changes between D2, D3, and D4. At the bottom of – at the south end of D3, what it did was it took from, I believe, 27th to 22nd Avenue, back into D2. Which is, you know, some people consider the Grove, you know, you could get, argue as to whether that's part of the traditional Grove or not, but that – it is what it is. That's what it's done. What it then does is, that bottom part continues to go up, it goes past Simpson Park, and it goes further east into the downtown area. In the dis – in the division between 3 and 4, it moves the district line a couple of blocks to address the issue that was discussed regarding Domino Park. And at the bottom it also does a little turn, basically that and the change that was done at the north end between 3 and 4 were issues that we had to deal with to equalize population. So district, the – alt 3 map has District 5's alternative to District 5 and does not touch District 1, only changes between 2, 3, and 4. Okay, next.

District 2's alternative map has a 4.2% deviation. It also brings Morningside back into D2, and it takes basically all the area south of US 1 that, in the base plan was wrapping around District 4, was part of D3 wrapping around District 4, all of that is incorporated now into D2. So the major changes are: all area south of US 1 goes back into D2 and Morningside goes back into D2. Have I accurately described your plan? Okay.

Sabina Covo: And keeps the Grove united.

Miguel De Grandy: And keeps the Grove united. Okay. Next.

Chris Johnson: That's all.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Sabina Covo: This is a –

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Into, into the microphone.

3 Miguel De Grandy: That's the last one? Oh, okay.

4 Chris Johnson: That's the last one.

5 Miguel De Grandy: Okay, so I gave you all of them.

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, that's it.

7 Miguel De Grandy: All right. So those are the, you know, the different alternatives. As I've
8 said many times to you before and not necessarily to you, Commissioner Covo, because you
9 weren't there at that – at the first round, but there are literally thousands of ways to draw a
10 constitutional map. We approach the draft plan from the point of view of looking only at race as
11 was necessary to comply with the Voting Rights Act in D5. We have otherwise not considered any
12 racial or ethnic considerations. Have basically provided a different political and policy alternative
13 from the plaintiff based on my conversations with the majority of you. And with that madam chair,
14 I am available to ask – answer questions, and I leave it to you to debate, discuss, and vote.

15 Joe Carollo: Got a quick question madam chair.

16 Christine King: Go ahead.

17 Joe Carollo: What is, by law, the highest deviation that we can go to?

18 Miguel De Grandy: Normally the courts have set kind of a bright line – overall deviation should
19 not exceed 10%. That is what they consider substantial equality.

20 Joe Carollo: 10%?

21 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

22 Joe Carollo: And we're way below the –

23 Miguel De Grandy: I believe, and again, you know, since we've done this pretty fast, but I

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 believe there is no map that goes beyond 5% overall deviation.

2 Joe Carollo: No. In fact, they're quite low. The alternative maps that we were shown by
3 plaintiffs, what deviation were they in? What range?

4 Miguel De Grandy: I forget Alternative 1. From memory I could tell you Alternative 2 is 6.9%,
5 and the alternative that they dropped on us last night was 5%.

6 Joe Carollo: Okay. So they're all much higher than any of the deviations that we have.

7 Miguel De Grandy: They are higher, they are within acceptable range but they are higher. The
8 Alternative 1, commissioner, had 5.3, of the plaintiffs had 5.3 deviation.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: The, the – if I may, madam chair. The draft plan proposal that we have
10 here is identical to Version 12, is that correct?

11 Miguel De Grandy: The draft plan proposal is –

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Identical to district – to Version 12.

13 Miguel De Grandy: The draft plan is Version 12.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Is Version 12, okay.

15 Miguel De Grandy: Yes sir.

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No changes.

17 Miguel De Grandy: No change.

18 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay.

19 Miguel De Grandy: Every – all changes were made from Version 12 by the different
20 commissioners.

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So the – for the purpose of discussion, without any motion or anything
22 yet, we can talk a little bit, I think, about the amendments, the minor tweaks that we want to do to
23 this draft plan proposal, right, instead of having a back and forth on five different plans? So the –

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 what's being presented before us as a draft plan proposal, which the city manager and city attorney
2 and our experts, there are some tweaks that have to be made to that. I understand the conversation
3 we had before the break. Can we, for practical purposes, just work off that version and say, well,
4 add this, take that out, whatever it is, it is, right? And then we still can have the debate about the
5 other five, or the other four plans, right?

6 Sabina Covo: Um –

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Because I think it's just a back and forth that's not going to result in
8 anything other than that would be a final result everyone knows is going to be, right?

9 Sabina Covo: Um, I have a suggestion madam chair. To your point, Commissioner Díaz de la
10 Portilla, if we have five maps and we already saw them, right, and we have this as a base plan? We
11 might discuss from this one, including the petitions that we have in each of our plans.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's the idea, yeah.

13 Sabina Covo: I mean, that would – like for instance –

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

15 Sabina Covo: – if my priority is actually to keep Coconut Grove together, then we can discuss
16 it and see what I can get from that because in the second plan, from the one that I had before, I
17 lose from what I've seen, about 4,000 people. So things like that, I think that if everyone agrees
18 we could work it out of Version 12 since all of them come from Version 12.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

20 Sabina Covo: We already saw each of our ideas. I'm not sure what you guys think about that.

21 Chris Johnson: Yeah, and –

22 Christine King: Yes.

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: I'd like to make one tweak.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: We'll go to tweaking in a minute. The idea is we start, I would think, from Version 12, and then we can do the, I don't know, for example, Version 14, my version, I already put on the record that it's constitutionally compliant, as every other version is. So that's already done. So I'm done with that. And now I'm in Version 12, the draft plan proposal. Let's take it from there, and everybody can say what they want, what they don't want, and then we move forward from that. It's an easier way to get there. It's a better roadmap than discussing five plans that are gonna take us all over the place.

Christine King: Right. I don't, I don't think we need to discuss five plans. I think, from what I heard, D3 alternative map incorporates all of us. And then the map that doesn't coincide with the D3 alternative map is the D2 alternative map. I think those are the only two that we need to – because for Commissioner Reyes, for Commissioner Carollo, for myself, I don't know if you're [looking at Díaz de la Portilla] in favor of D3, the D3 alternative map. Which is the –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: The D3 alternative plan is the amended draft plan proposal that –

Christine King: Yes.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – takes it two blocks down to include Domino Park and back into Commissioner – district –

Christine King: Yes.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – that's – Commissioner Carollo's district.

Christine King: Yes.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's fine. There's no other change, right?

Christine King: I have one other change that I'd like to make.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah. No, there's no other change as far as Commissioner Carollo is

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 concerned?

2 Christine King: No.

3 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay, we're done with that.

4 Christine King: Yes.

5 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So 3 and 4 are happy with each other.

6 Christine King: Yes.

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So there's kumbaya going on over there.

8 Christine King: And 5.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: What you want here is you want a People's Bar-B-Que.

10 Christine King: Yes.

11 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. I'm going to give you that. You got People's Bar-B-Que.

12 Christine King: I'd like –

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: All right, that's fine.

14 Christine King: That was an oversight –

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's – and I'll tell you why, because you've invested – your
16 Overtown CRA has invested a lot of dollars to a historic restaurant that means a lot to that
17 community and to your community.

18 Christine King: Yes.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And I understand. I would like every once in a while to be able to
20 have some ribs and some oxtail there, but that's a different conversation, I'll pay for it. Not a
21 problem. But I can still go there, right?

22 Christine King: Absolutely.

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: You sure?

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: Absolutely.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: For the record, let the record reflect that I can still go to People's Bar-B-Que.

Christine King: Absolutely.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: All right, so we'll include that in the amendment.

Christine King: Right. So –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's fine.

Christine King: If you can include that into the D3 –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: D3 –

Christine King: – alternative map.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Christine King: So that keeps it in line with the consensus that we have.

Miguel De Grandy: Could you, commissioner, give us bearings set directions –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: We will, and I want to make sure it's only People's Bar-B-Que, nothing else.

Christine King: It is.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Don't get greedy.

Christine King: It will be – it's 7th Street. It's just after you get – it's just one block –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 350 NW 8th Street.

Christine King: Is that the address?

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, that's the address.

Christine King: Okay.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 350 NW 8th Street. 350 NW 8th Street. Best oxtail –

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Chris Johnson: I will bring –

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Best oxtail in town when they reopen right, right?

3 Chris Johnson: So I'd bring this southern border down to 7th Street from 8th Street.

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

5 Christine King: Yes. Please.

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's – one block. No, you bring it up, from 7th Street to 8th Street.

7 Chris Johnson: The current southern border –

8 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I'm sorry, you bring down the southern border, that's correct. You're
9 correct, yes.

10 Christine King: Yes. And you –

11 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 350, again –

12 Christine King: Leave that in D3, the alternate D3 alternative map and –

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: As amended, 350 NW 8th Street is now included in District 5. No
14 longer in District 1.

15 Miguel De Grandy: Okay. But –

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But only one block, only that place, nothing else. Nothing to the left,
17 nothing to the right, nothing to the center, nothing –

18 Miguel De Grandy: And precisely, so there is no misunderstanding and also so the record
19 reflects what's being done, certainly you're free to continue to debate different plans, et cetera, but
20 before –

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: The involvement and the investment –

22 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah, before there is a motion, we'd actually like to model and put on the
23 screen –

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: Please.

Miguel De Grandy: – that change –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Christine King: And tell us about –

Miguel De Grandy: – make sure that everybody –

Christine King: – the deviation.

Miguel De Grandy: – okay with it.

Christine King: Yes.

Miguel De Grandy: Okay?

Joe Carollo: Good, good idea.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Miguel De Grandy: Okay. So that, once your debate is finished, will take us 10 minutes to do and I'll show it up on the screen.

Sabina Covo: So are we still debating from D3 or from 12?

Christine King: D3.

Sabina Covo: Okay.

Christine King: Well –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: D3 is 12.

Christine King: It's – they're all the Version 12, but the D3 alternative map –

Sabina Covo: Is the one that looks more similar?

Christine King: Is the one that there's most consensus about.

Sabina Covo: Okay.

Miguel De Grandy: Do you want to put that one up and me to go over it again or not? No.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: Umm.

Miguel De Grandy: I'm yours all day.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: We're not going to be here all day. And neither are you because we're done. I think we're almost there, right? Yeah.

Christine King: I think so.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

Victoria Méndez: So for purposes just of the record while he's putting it up, while Chris is putting it up, Mr. De Grandy, can we just place on the record the D3 alternative map and just what you wanted to say really quickly?

Miguel De Grandy: No, no, no. The only thing that I wanted to make sure is to have Chris make that change, the People's Bar-B-Que –

Christine King: And does that change the deviation any, I'd like to know that.

Miguel De Grandy: I understand but, you know, I'd like to see –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's People's Bar-B-Que, how much can you change the deviation?

Miguel De Grandy: It, it, it may be zero.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: There are no residents –

Christine King: I don't think you would change it all.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: There are no residents, the People's Bar-B-Que –

Christine King: I don't think it would change it at all but I just want to put it on the record.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Miguel De Grandy: But I understand Madam Chair, but I'd like you to see it –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Of course.

Miguel De Grandy: – visually, and say that's what I asked for.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So we –

2 Miguel De Grandy: Or that's not what I asked for.

3 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So we take a 10 minute recess.

4 Joe Carollo: No, no, no.

5 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: There –

6 Christine King: Um, no, no, no, because if I lose you –

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, no I'm saying –

8 Christine King: – I might lose you for 30 minutes.

9 Miguel De Grandy: It'll take him less than 10 minutes.

10 Joe Carollo: Can I ask to –

11 Sabina Covo: Before – okay.

12 Joe Carollo: – put in the record a couple of things while we're waiting?

13 Christine King: Yes.

14 Joe Carollo: Mr. De Grandy.

15 Joe Carollo: What is – since on these three districts we're not going to have People's Bar-B-
16 Que doing a deviation in District 4, 3, and 2, what is the population on each of these districts the
17 way you have it now?

18 Miguel De Grandy: I have to wait for my data guy to give us the numbers.

19 Joe Carollo: What, what do we hire you for? Is the data guy that we need?

20 Miguel De Grandy: There's only one computer and I don't have it so.

21 Sabina Covo: Can I ask a question Madam Chair? I want to know, because I'm extremely
22 committed and I want to put it on the record to keep Coconut Grove united, as you already know.
23 Can you give me the number of how many, from the map that we have now currently under which

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 we're working, what else do I lose from the North Grove with this map? Can we see those
2 numbers?

3 Miguel De Grandy: Yes ma'am.

4 Sabina Covo: That's important. To see if, at least, I can get part of the Grove united because I
5 see that I don't have a consensus, but I really need to fight for this.

6 Miguel De Grandy: Yes, ma'am. As soon as Chris finishes with that and gets back on the
7 screen, I will walk you through that.

8 Joe Carollo: I believe, um –

9 Miguel De Grandy: I mean, I could tell you from memory, it restores the 1,571 in the plan that
10 was struck down, that went, south in the, in the Grove back into D2, so that's 1,571. And it keeps
11 that line of US 1 intact. And then there was a portion in the draft plan that went from 27th Avenue
12 to 22nd Avenue that was in the draft plan in D3. Commissioner Carollo ceded that property or that
13 land back into D2. So those are the gains –

14 Sabina Covo: What about the rest of Alarka Street and Bay Heights?

15 Miguel De Grandy: Bay Heights remains in D3.

16 Sabina Covo: Remains in D3?

17 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

18 Sabina Covo: But it was in D2. So now I'm giving up Bay Heights, technically.

19 Miguel De Grandy: That is correct.

20 Sabina Covo: I want to see those numbers, I'm not going to vote for that. I'm getting less from
21 the Grove.

22 Miguel De Grandy: You're – well, it's –

23 Sabina Covo: I mean from uniting Coconut Grove, I'm getting less now.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Miguel De Grandy: Uh, if you look at –

2 Sabina Covo: And that's what my constituents are asking for.

3 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah, if I if you look at numbers, I can walk you through those numbers,
4 it's really –

5 Sabina Covo: I mean, I just want to put the numbers on the record.

6 Miguel De Grandy: Sure, sure. But I'm trying to respond to your question. It's a trade-off
7 what, what that amendment does is it gives back to the Grove from 27th to 22nd, and then it
8 continues to go up where it ended in the draft plan, up all the way to Simpson Park and into part
9 of downtown. So it creates a straight line on South Miami Avenue.

10 Sabina Covo: Okay. Let's keep rolling. I don't see the logic in it but –

11 Miguel De Grandy: I – that's not for me to say that's – you're the policymakers.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay

13 Christine King: [inaudible 02:11:44] data man.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's the point of the recess, right? I'll be here.

15 Christine King: Let it sit right here.

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right here.

17 [Background Conversations]

18 Victoria Méndez: Now he's going to tweak –

19 Miguel De Grandy: He's going to put it up now

20 Victoria Méndez: – with People's Bar-B-Que.

21 Miguel De Grandy: As soon as you can x.

22 Victoria Méndez: Right. You, you can have it. They're going to be –

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That was fast.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Victoria Méndez: – talking about it.

2 Miguel De Grandy: Less than 10 minutes. Could you blow up that area? I just want to make
3 sure.

4 [Background Conversation]

5 Chris Johnson: So we just moved the border here in the Overtown region down from 8th Street
6 down to 7th.

7 Miguel De Grandy: Could you blow it up more?

8 Chris Johnson: That's as much as it's letting me blow up on this thing.

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: How many, if I may –

10 Miguel De Grandy: Okay.

11 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – how many people are you adding and subtracting?

12 Chris Johnson: It actually reduces the deviation slightly to –

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I know, that's what I thought.

14 Chris Johnson: Yeah.

15 Christine King: What's the deviation now?

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – by how much? 3.3. Okay.

17 Joe Carollo: Which deviation? The –

18 Christine King: D3.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 3.3.

20 Manolo Reyes: That's right.

21 Christine King: D3. All.

22 Joe Carollo: D3?

23 Christine King: It's the whole map.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: The whole map is 3.3.

2 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah.

3 Christine King: 3.3.

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But how many people are you adding to District 5 when you take
5 away from District 1? Or – right? You’re adding a block, how many people?

6 Chris Johnson: Give me one moment I can look that up.

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. I thought that’s what you were doing in the 10 minute break
8 you had.

9 Christine King: The devia – the – is it

10 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I’m being rough on him. I’m being –

11 Christine King: – the lower the deviation, is that better?

12 Miguel De Grandy: The lower the deviation –

13 Christine King: It’s better.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Of course, yeah.

15 Christine King: The lower the –

16 Miguel De Grandy: Zero is perfect.

17 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And by the way –

18 Christine King: So you – but the lower our deviation is the better?

19 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

20 Christine King: But we can go as high as 10%?

21 Miguel De Grandy: You could, at that point the court is probably going to need –

22 Christine King: To look, right.

23 Miguel De Grandy: – justifications on the record

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: Uh-huh.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: What's the deviation of the, of the plaintiffs' map that they're proposing?

Miguel De Grandy: There was 1 – 1 was 5.3, I believe, Alt 2 was 6.9 –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right.

Miguel De Grandy: – and Alt 3 was 5%.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So ours is a lot better.

Miguel De Grandy: It's the lowest deviation

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: In terms of the – absolutely.

Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. How many people are you adding?

Chris Johnson: 530 people are being moved, commissioner.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 530 people are being moved.

Chris Johnson: 530, yes.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: From that one block?

Chris Johnson: Uh, it's actually three blocks. It was a strip across the southern side.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, we had this conversation before. Your software may not allow you to do it, but we can do it, right, without – we have better software basically. So in essence why, you know, did they do the whole strip.

Joe Carollo: Yeah, but you're actually going to make the deviation a lot better and even it out. If you could –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Joe Carollo: – let me ask him –

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

2 Joe Carollo: – a question and you’ll get a better feel.

3 Miguel De Grandy: And the software, commissioner, if I could interrupt for a second, goes to
4 the block level. We can’t go any further than that.

5 Joe Carollo: If you could give us –

6 Chris Johnson: I could move just that one block.

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

8 Chris Johnson: But –

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Of course, you can.

10 Chris Johnson: – that other two blocks that – I could do that. I understood you wanted me to
11 bring the border down to 7th Street –

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, no, no, I gave you an address.

13 Chris Johnson: Okay.

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: There’s a reason why I gave you a specific address, I didn’t say – I
15 said it’s a block south, but I gave you a specific address. Was it three, three –

16 Chris Johnson: Can I have one minute?

17 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Of course. You got more than one minute.

18 Joe Carollo: Before you go in the one minute. Can you give me –

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 350.

20 Joe Carollo: – because these three are not going to change the total population for D4, D3, and
21 D2?

22 Chris Johnson: Yes commissioner.

23 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I don’t, I don’t – I know what he did. Take a look at this, Chris, he’s

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 going to bring you something right now.

2 Chris Johnson: Commissioner, the total population of District 3 is at 89,194 in that version of
3 the map.

4 Joe Carollo: Right.

5 Chris Johnson: D4 is 89,555, and D5 is 86,600 –

6 Joe Carollo: No, no, no, I said D2.

7 Chris Johnson: Oh. D2 is 89,593.

8 Joe Carollo: Okay, so these three districts are right together in numbers?

9 Chris Johnson: Yes, commissioner.

10 Joe Carollo: Okay.

11 Miguel De Grandy: Very close.

12 Joe Carollo: All right. So let's see once you've worked it out what these two others have.

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right. Correct.

14 Joe Carollo: Obviously, there are considerations and which districts in the future are going to
15 grow, have the most growth.

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's, that's the issue, right? So we don't want to go beyond – it
17 doesn't impact any other district, it's really a debate between District 5 and District 1, right?

18 Sabina Covo: I want to –

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But hold on a second, I'm not finished.

20 Sabina Covo: Okay. Sorry, I'll go after.

21 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I'm sorry. So the debate this part, this particular part to get this off
22 the table, you're right, it's a growth, but we have to be concerned about the growth. Commissioner
23 Covo, your district is way overpopulated. So at the end of the day –

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Sabina Covo: That's, that's what –

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – you're going to have to lose stuff.

3 Sabina Covo: I know that I have to –

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So you got to pick your poison, whether you like it or not. You got to
5 lose some stuff.

6 Sabina Covo: If –

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: But not part – that's not the point I'm making. The point I'm making
8 is between District 5, and District 2.

9 Sabina Covo: Okay.

10 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And District 1, I'm sorry. So in essence, you got the map there, we
11 want People's Bar-B-Que to get – to stop talking about People's Bar-B-Que, we can. District 5 has
12 publicly agreed that she's okay with only having that. You already have a map, what's given to
13 you right now on the record. So you're fully aware of what we want to do. Change that and leave
14 it alone, and then we talk about everything else.

15 Chris Johnson: I'm going to put it up on the screen for you right now.

16 Sabina Covo: No, but madam chair, I want to answer your question. So what's happening is
17 that when we draw my map, and if you want you can also pull it again. We're still within the
18 constitutional lines, we still are compliant with District 5, we are still in the deviation that is correct.
19 We reunite the Grove, I keep Bay Point and Morningside as well. I'm still a bit overpopulated
20 because we went through the numbers. What I'm asking for, again, is with all due respect, to try
21 and keep the Grove more united. Because in this version I lose even more borders of the North
22 Grove. And that's part of the amount of people that came to us and say, "We really want the grove
23 united." So I'm fighting for what my constituents want, technically.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Christine King: Let me ask a question. Is the Bahamian community in the Grove in the D3
2 alternative map?

3 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

5 Christine King: The Bahamian community is in the Grove. Okay.

6 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah. What, what we did, commissioner, if you recall, the original plan
7 had, I believe it was 1,571 folks that we crossed south of US 1, created a little triangle to bring that
8 into D4, to equalize population. We have taken that out. So the line at that part of the Grove is US
9 1, which is, you know, I would argue it was only a little sliver of the Bahamian Grove, but
10 nevertheless, the answer to your question is the Bahamian Grove is now in the Grove.

11 Christine King: Okay, because that was a huge contention the first time around, that the
12 Bahamian Grove was taken out of D1.

13 Miguel De Grandy: D2.

14 Christine King: D2. But now the Bahamian Grove –

15 Miguel De Grandy: Is back in D2.

16 Christine King: – is back in D2.

17 Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

18 Christine King: Okay.

19 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So Commissioner Covo, you've done a heck of a lot of a better job
20 than your predecessor did, by the way.

21 Sabina Covo: Thank you, but I still need to do better. I still need –

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I understand.

23 Sabina Covo: – a chunk of the North Grove to make sure that I'm happy.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: You're doing a lot better than Commissioner Russell ever did for
2 keeping that community divided. The problem that you have, and that we all have, is that your
3 district is overly populated.

4 Sabina Covo: I could keep the North Grove –

5 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And that's the problem.

6 Sabina Covo: – together and give up some of the West Brickell part as well if we can see those
7 numbers.

8 Miguel De Grandy: Again, that –

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Do you have the new map?

10 Miguel De Grandy: That's up to you.

11 Christine King: So this —

12 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah, it'll come up in a minute.

13 Christine King: You have – you're putting up the D3 alternative map, which is now the
14 deviation is 3.3.

15 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Correct.

16 Christine King: And it includes the Bahamian Grove?

17 Miguel De Grandy: Yes. The deviation, I don't believe, it'll be 3.3 because 3.3 –

18 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 3.6, that's fine.

19 Miguel De Grandy: Yeah it's 3.6.

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: And you only took out –

21 Christine King: Now it's 3.6?

22 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's fine.

23 Miguel De Grandy: It's 3.6.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

Christine King: With the inclusion of People's Bar-B-Que?

Miguel De Grandy: Yes.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Miguel De Grandy: With the inclusion of People's Bar-B-Que.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I'm looking at it but –

Christine King: Oh, I thought he just said it was 3.3.

Miguel De Grandy: It was 3.3 when he put in three blocks.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: When he put in one block.

Miguel De Grandy: And you all said, no, it's just People's Bar-B-Que.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yes.

Miguel De Grandy: So he rerun the numbers –

Christine King: Okay.

Miguel De Grandy: – to 3.6.

Joe Carollo: Once you put in the three blocks that we –

Christine King: Right, so we can get –

Joe Carollo: – a deviation of 3.3?

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: No, but it's not that much of a difference, in the Grove –

Victoria Méndez: We need –

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: – it's, no, 3.3 and 3.6 versus 5.9 were the plaintiffs' map –

Miguel DeGrandy: 5.3, 6.9 and 5.0.

Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Right. We're still in a good constitutional ground and I think we have a good case. The growth there is going to be very interesting moving forward. I think it works. It's not the end of the world.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Victoria Méndez: So what is, just for the record, what is the map that we're looking at right
2 now is –

3 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 3.6.

4 Victoria Méndez: – the D3 alternatives map?

5 Miguel De Grandy: Alternative – version –

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's District 3 alternative map version 3, I think, right?

7 Miguel De Grandy: No, version 2. Well, version 3.

8 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Version 3, yeah. Version 3.

9 Miguel De Grandy: You did a 2 that they didn't accept. Okay, version 3.

10 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Version 3, District 3.

11 Miguel De Grandy: 3.6.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: 3.6.

13 Victoria Méndez: And it includes what change? The People's –

14 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: That's the only change that includes right there on the map.

15 Victoria Méndez: Okay.

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: So we're –

17 Victoria Méndez: I just wanted – remember that we just need to be clear for the written record.

18 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: It's very clear.

19 Victoria Méndez: Okay.

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: We've said it three times, very clear. 3.6 deviation, it includes People's
21 Bar-B-Que to District 5 from District 1, and it includes the Bahamian Grove into District 2, back
22 into District 2. The argument that the plaintiffs made that the Black Grove, as they call it for lack
23 of a better term, was divided and now it's united. It also includes every other amendment and

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 suggestion from every other commissioner that's been made. And I think there's, it's clear that we
2 can now move this and then have a discussion about it because I think we're in a good place,
3 instead of prolonging the debate.

4 Joe Carollo: Can I get for the record now with the change of those two blocks of People's Bar-
5 B-Que? Is it two blocks or one block?

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: One block.

7 Joe Carollo: One block, People's –

8 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Versus three, yeah.

9 Joe Carollo: What is then the final population of D1 and D5?

10 Miguel De Grandy: Total pop?

11 Joe Carollo: Yeah.

12 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

13 Chris Johnson: So Commissioner, D1 is now 87,455.

14 Joe Carollo: Okay.

15 Chris Johnson: And D5 is now 86,444.

16 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah.

17 Joe Carollo: So it's only a 10 person difference from what I –

18 Chris Johnson: Correct.

19 Joe Carollo: – what I had before. Okay.

20 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, that's fine. All right, not a big deal.

21 Victoria Méndez: Also for the record, um, Mr. De Grandy, it is fully compliant with all your
22 constitutional bells and whistles?

23 Miguel De Grandy: Yes, ma'am.

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 Victoria Méndez: Okay, thank you so much.

2 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Can I now move it or not yet?

3 Sabina Covo: Can I get one more question, please, before you move it?

4 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah. Well, I can move it and you can discuss anything you want
5 after.

6 Sabina Covo: Then please move it and we'll discuss it afterwards.

7 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Okay can I move it?

8 Sabina Covo: Madam Chair says yes

9 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I move it. Commissioner Reyes seconds and now we, now we discuss
10 it. What's happened to your microphone? It died. There comes Todd.

11 Sabina Covo: I have –

12 Christine King: – To the rescue. I have a motion and a second, and now we open it up for
13 discussion.

14 Sabina Covo: So my first question and request would be, why Coconut Grove will lose also
15 Bay Heights. When Bay Heights was part of it, does it make a real difference in the numbers?
16 Because Bay Heights has been a historical part of Coconut Grove as well.

17 Miguel De Grandy: It would make a difference. Anything you do makes a difference in the
18 numbers and the issue is how does that ripple, and how does that increase the deviation? But all of
19 them are policy choices for you to make.

20 Sabina Covo: Can we see, please, see those numbers? Let's see what – see exactly what
21 happens when Bay Heights comes back to D2.

22 Miguel De Grandy: Bay Heights, you would have to take everything that wraps around D4
23 from the south border all the way up. Because you can't just take Bay Heights, that disconnects

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 the southern part of that District 3.

2 Sabina Covo: But the lines before went like that. I mean, the lines before were like going down
3 and they were –

4 Miguel De Grandy: But before, the configuration of D4 was somewhat different. I mean, you
5 know, I can tell you where the lines, where the streets are. If you look at where the border of
6 District 4 is with District 3, that street that comes down, I believe if I'm not mistaken, that's the
7 north – that's the south wall of Bay Heights. Right there. So I cannot connect the remaining
8 southern portion to D3. I would have to take from D4 to be able to connect to that southern part of
9 D3, which is what was done in the previous map.

10 Sabina Covo: What happens after we vote on these maps if the judge doesn't like it?

11 Miguel De Grandy If the judge doesn't like it –

12 Sabina Covo: Because it doesn't look very similar to the plaintiffs' maps. I just – I'm just
13 curious to see what the process is moving forward.

14 Miguel De Grandy The plaintiffs' maps are – their concept of what should be done. Doesn't
15 have any more validity, and as a matter of fact, each one of your maps that you would adopt comes
16 to the court with a presumption of good faith. So, actually, your plan has more weight for a court
17 than the plaintiffs' map.

18 Sabina Covo: But they can also say that they don't like it as well. I just want to know due
19 process, how does it – is it going to go?

20 Miguel De Grandy: When you talk about they do you mean the court or the –

21 Sabina Covo: The court.

22 Miguel De Grandy: Oh, of course. The court could say, "I don't like it." And if your question
23 is what happens then, what happens then, as I said before is, the court could accept any one of the

Miami City Commission - June 14, 2023

1 alternatives that have been proposed and the court could elect to have a special master to draw its
2 own plan, or the court can elect to take one of the plaintiffs' plans. The court is the court. The court
3 has the power to do what it feels is correct.

4 Sabina Covo: Got it.

5 Christine King: Are we ready to take a vote?

6 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: I'm ready and call the question there, right?

7 Christine King: All in favor of the D3 alternative map as amended.

8 Miguel De Grandy: v.3

9 Christine King: v.3. Let – I'm going to read the whole thing. D3 alternative map as amended
10 v.3.

11 Miguel De Grandy: With a 3.6% deviation.

12 Christine King: With a 3.6% deviation.

13 Alex Díaz de la Portilla: Aye.

14 Christine King: All in favor?

15 Sabina Covo: I'm voting, I'm voting no.

16 Christine King: All in favor? Aye.

17 Joe Carollo: Aye.

18 Manolo Reyes: Aye.

19 Christine King: Motion carries four to one. We have our map.

20 Miguel De Grandy: Thank you.

21 Christine King: This meeting has now – is now concluded. Thank you all.



Vanana Online Services, Inc.
Think Service Think Vanana

Certificate of Transcription

Transcription of File Name: CityCommission-SpecialMeeting-Jun14th2023.ts

We, Vanana Online Services, Inc. a professional transcription company, hereby certify that the above-mentioned document(s) has/have been transcribed by our qualified and experienced transcriber(s) is/are accurate and true transcription of the original document(s)

This is to certify the correctness of the Transcription only. We cannot guarantee the veracity of the original File. Our Transcriber is in no way related, by immediate family ties or marriage, to any parties related to the materials Transcribed.

A copy of the transcription is attached to this certification.



Crystal Nichols, Production Manager.



Dated: 30th day of June 2023

Vanana Online Services, Inc.
ATA Member #266532
ISO 9001:2015